

SSJP Learning and Evidence Literature Review

# Evidence from Gender Equality and Social Inclusion (GESI) Interventions in FCAS

April 2021

## SSJP Learning & Evidence Literature Review

### Paper Seven: Evidence from FCAS security & justice interventions

#### 1. Introduction

This literature review summarises existing studies and research into interventions that aim to increase security and expand access to justice for women and marginalised groups in global contexts comparative to Somalia. It is divided into three sections. Section One describes the evidence base for different types of security and justice (S&J) programming, Section Two describes the limitations of this evidence base, and Section Three provides some conclusions about what interventions may be relevant in the Somali context.

The focus of global literature is heavily skewed towards interventions aimed at increasing access to justice and security specifically for women, rather than for marginalised groups such as internally displaced persons (IDPs), and particularly on access to justice for gender-based violence (GBV). As a result, this review shares this focus, but has also sought to include information about programmes focused on women, marginalised groups and justice and security interventions unrelated to GBV, where such information is available. This review focuses on jurisdictions comparable to Somalia and interventions that increase access to justice and security services as an outcome, rather than interventions aimed at reducing or preventing GBV.

GBV is defined as violence directed against a person because of that person's gender or violence that affects persons of a particular gender disproportionately. GBV can be directed towards women, men, boys and girls. Globally, women and children are disproportionately affected by GBV, and often interventions to address GBV specifically focus on violence against women (VAW). Combating GBV committed in the context of conflict is a key component of the Women Peace and Security (WPS) agenda. Types of GBV include:

- **Intimate partner violence (IPV)** includes all acts of physical, sexual, psychological and economic violence that occur within the family, domestic unit, or between intimate partners.
- **Sexual violence** includes rape and other forms of sexualised violence, for example sexual assault, castrations and sexual mutilation.
- **Physical GBV** is physical violence committed against a person on the basis of their gender, such as physical attacks on women for reasons of honour, or on men who do not conform to traditional gender roles.
- **Female Genital Mutilation (FGM)** is the ritual cutting or removal of some or all of the external female genitalia
- **Forced and early marriage** refers to marriage concluded under force or coercion, including the marriage of children under minimum age.
- **Sexual exploitation and abuse** refers to a situation in which perpetrators take advantage of a position of power or authority to sexually exploit or abuse a more vulnerable person. This is usually referred to within the humanitarian sector, where aid workers or peacekeepers take advantage of the communities they are charged with protecting, but may also occur in other situations where there is an unequal power dynamic, such as between teachers and students in a school setting.

Combatting GBV requires a spectrum of interventions, from combatting social norms, to addressing economic tensions that increase the risk of GBV, to increasing the capacity of the

security and justice sector to respond to offences when they occur. The World Health Organization's 'RESPECT' framework for addressing GBV sets out a process for assessing the root causes of GBV, assessing the evidence for potential interventions and testing and scaling up programming in an evidence-based way.<sup>1</sup> This review focuses on security and justice sector responses, which constitute only one of the possible interventions that may be deployed in response to a RESPECT assessment of GBV risks and appropriate responses. Such interventions focus on perpetrators, potential perpetrators, survivors and at-risk communities: they aim to promote accountability; deter future violations; provide survivors with access to legal redress; and protect those who may be at risk through targeted security interventions and infrastructure. It is notable that the literature reviewed for this report does not include strong evidence linking increased rates of reporting, access to legal services or even increased conviction rates to either overall decreases in rates of GBV or strengthened perceptions of safety and security. These findings should be viewed with caution given the difficulty in measuring prevention, as increased rates of reporting and increased convictions will always make it look as if GBV numbers have risen, even when they have not. It is also important to keep in mind that justice and security programming is often weighted towards interventions that take place after crimes have already been committed. This means that while programming may be impactful in supporting survivors to access justice, it will be less impactful in terms of making them feel safe from GBV before it occurs. Interventions that are most likely to prevent GBV from happening in the first place are often non-S&J programmes such as those described in part 1.8 of this report.

Most of the intervention types considered in this report are also relevant to programming intended to increase access to justice and security for women and marginalised groups which does not have a focus on GBV. The lack of legal protections and access to the formal justice system for women and marginalised groups in Somalia and globally increases their risk of experiencing violations in many areas of life, and for perpetrators enjoying impunity for those violations, including in relation to land grabbing and insecurity of tenure; discrimination and ill-treatment by public and private organizations; violations against people with disabilities; and lack of access to police, lawyers, courts and justice outcomes that allow victims of violations to continue with their lives. The interventions assessed, which include a focus on increasing awareness of legal rights; identifying entry points to the justice system for those who have been traditionally excluded from it; building infrastructure, skills and resources; policing interventions; and work with informal justice sectors are relevant to addressing each of these gaps and challenges.

## 2. Methodology

This paper examines global evidence with a focus on fragile and conflict-affected situations (FCAS). It draws on academic and grey literature retrieved from a search of online databases, and provides a high-level grading of evidence following the guidelines provided by DFID in 2014.<sup>2</sup>

The paper considers seven types of interventions:

1. Interventions to increase awareness of legal rights;
2. Interventions to provide entry points to the justice system;

---

<sup>1</sup> WHO (2019) 'Respect Women: Preventing Violence Against Women'

<sup>2</sup> DFID, *How to Note: Assessing the Strength of Evidence*, (London: Department for International Development, 2014).

3. Interventions to build infrastructure, skills and resources;
4. Interventions with the police to make them more community-orientated;
5. Interventions to provide specialised justice services for women;
6. Interventions with the informal justice sector;
7. Non-justice/security interventions:

### 3.Key Findings

This review concludes that there is **insufficient evidence for all of the interventions considered** to conclude whether they would be appropriate to the Somali context. However, the research did highlight possible strategies that warrant further research and consideration. For example, there is reference in the literature to lessons learned and standards formulated within **paralegal programmes** in West African post-conflict contexts, which may have potential relevance in Somalia. Lessons learned from **training programmes** with police and communities in comparative jurisdictions include the following: that training must be long-term, are more impactful when conducted with both genders together, and more effective when conducted as conversations rather than lectures; and police training must secure buy-in from senior ranks, and be co-conducted by police trainers. Some reports on **community policing approaches** in jurisdictions such as the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC) include interesting and potentially relevant findings. Other strategies that are described in the literature and which could be the subject of further research and/or pilot projects to test their impact include **coordinated community response (CCR)** security programmes and the use of screenings by different service providers to identify and refer GBV survivors. There is also some evidence about **what does not work: putting gender desks in police stations** without robustly funding and resourcing them as part of a more holistic project; **law reform alone; and one-off trainings**. Finally, the literature demonstrates that, in order to have the greatest impact, interventions designed to increase access to justice for GBV should be **complemented by other types of GBV programming**, such as economic and social empowerment programmes with adults and children.

The impact of these interventions is summarised in the following table. Each of the programme types is then described in the sections to follow, along with an assessment of the strength of the evidence available about their impact in contexts comparable to Somalia.

Category of intervention	Overall evidence of impact in relevant contexts	Assessment of evidence strength	Examples from
<i>Increased awareness of legal rights</i>			
Awareness Campaigns and Edutainment	Low	No high quality or systematic studies, some experimental and observational studies in	South Africa, Nepal

		non-comparative jurisdictions.	
Trainings	Low	Systematic review and quasi-systemic reviews globally and in Africa, but looking at impact on decreasing rates of GBV rather than increasing legal knowledge.	Across Africa
Community Activism	Low	Four systematic review and some experimental studies.	DRC (general GBV); Egypt, Sudan, Ethiopia, Kenya and Senegal (FGM/C)
<i>Entry points to the justice system</i>			
One-stop rape crisis centres	Low	One systematic review which is not focused on access to justice, and some anecdotal reports.	Northern Uganda, South Sudan, Liberia, former Yugoslavia
Hotlines	Low	Very little evidence.	Lebanon, South Africa
Screening and Referrals	Low	One systematic review but without results for relevant contexts	High income countries
Assignment of Female Intermediaries	Low	Experimental studies, but none in relevant contexts	High income countries
<i>Infrastructure, skills and resources</i>			
Law reform	Low	Some qualitative research about the effect of law reform efforts in different regions. Quality of the research is unclear.	Global studies- no specific examples specified in the literature reviewed
Trainings with the Police	Low	One systematic review referencing two other reviews. Quality of the evidence is unclear.	Global studies- no specific examples specified in the literature reviewed
Mobile Courts	Low	One observational study in a comparative context, of medium quality.	DRC
<i>Community-orientated policing</i>			
Community-Policing Models	Low	A small number of experimental and quasi-experimental studies.	Papa New Guinea, DRC

Women and Minorities in Policing	Low	A small number of quasi-experimental studies.	Liberia
<i>Specialised justice services</i>			
Gender Desks	None	Anecdotal and NGO reports.	Kenya and Tanzania (but unsuccessful examples)
Women Police Stations	None	Systematic reviews and theoretical research, but not from comparative contexts.	Brazil, Ecuador, Nicaragua and Peru
Special Courts	None	A small number of observational studies in non-comparative jurisdictions.	High income countries, South Africa
<i>Links to the informal justice sector</i>			
Paralegals	Limited	Theoretical research, observational studies and NGO reports, of overall medium quality.	Liberia, Sierra Leone
Alternative Dispute Resolution	None	Systematic reviews, of low quality.	Ghana, Ethiopia and Nigeria
Coordinated Community Response	None	One systematic review and theoretical research from non-comparative contexts.	Ghana, as well as examples from Latin America, Asia and the US
<i>Non-justice/ security interventions</i>			
Economic Interventions	Limited	A large amount of systematic reviews, experimental studies and theoretical research.	Afghanistan, Mali, Ivory Coast
Couples and Parenting Programmes	None	Systematic reviews and experimental studies.	High income countries
School-Based Interventions	Limited	A medium number of systematic reviews and experimental studies.	Afghanistan

## 4. Evidence from interventions

### *Awareness Campaigns and Edutainment*

Many of the interventions assessed are in global reviews centred around awareness campaigns and edutainment programmes. This review considered campaigns that included information about the legal frameworks in countries relating to GBV, survivors' rights to access the justice system and the ways they can access legal services.<sup>3</sup> Such campaigns may include, for example, radio shows, billboards and social media content. The literature review was unable to find any studies which demonstrated that these types of interventions increased survivors' access to legal services or justice in relevant contexts. In less relevant contexts, no systematic reviews appear to have been conducted, and the body of evidence around the effectiveness of these types of interventions is considered low. However, some experimental studies in places including South Africa<sup>4</sup> and Nepal<sup>5</sup> do exist which indicate that higher numbers of people better understood legal definitions of GBV, or accessed GBV services, after being exposed to these types of campaigns. There are no examples in the literature assessed of campaigns that had the overall effect of either increasing prosecutions and convictions or decreasing any form of GBV.

### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- Social campaigns are a commonly used tool in Somalia. This review indicates that such interventions should be approached with caution, and designed around moderate objectives of increasing knowledge about how to access services.
- Increased knowledge does not lead to increased access as the barriers to accessing services include discriminatory social norms that prevent marginalised groups from acting on new knowledge.

### *Trainings to increase community knowledge of legal rights*

The available evidence about the impact of trainings has focused on whether they have been able to reduce rates of GBV, rather than whether they increase people's knowledge about their legal rights. For the purposes of this report, literature describing trainings that included information about the legal rights of women and marginalised groups, or that focused on how to access legal services, has been considered. The impact of these trainings in increasing awareness of legal rights is the focus of this assessment. It is often difficult to conclude what results have been achieved by trainings specifically, both because training activities are usually combined with other interventions, and because many of these interventions have been poorly assessed.<sup>6</sup> Two global systematic reviews and one quasi-systematic review in Africa contained a small amount of evidence that in some, well-implemented trainings, participants gained an increased understanding of particular issues, indicating that they may in some cases be an effective mechanism for increasing knowledge about legal rights.<sup>7</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup> A. Kerr-Wilson (January 2020) 'A rigorous global evidence review of interventions to prevent violence against women and girls' What Works and UK Aid, p 26.

<sup>4</sup> L. Heise (2011) 'What Works to Prevent Partner Violence? An evidence overview', STRIVE, p 25.

<sup>5</sup> DfID (May 2012) 'How to Note: A Practical Guide on Community Programming on Violence against Women and Girls', Violence against Women and Girls CHASE Guidance Note Series, p 17.

<sup>6</sup> L. Heise (2011) 'What Works to Prevent Partner Violence? An evidence overview', STRIVE.

<sup>7</sup> A. Kerr-Wilson (January 2020) 'A rigorous global evidence review of interventions to prevent violence against women and girls' What Works and UK Aid; D. Arango (2014) 'Interventions to Prevent or Reduce Violence Against Women and Girls: A Systematic Review of Reviews' World Bank; L. Heise (2011) 'What Works to Prevent Partner Violence? An evidence overview', STRIVE; M. Ellsberg et al (2014) 'Prevention of violence against women and girls: what does the evidence say?' Lancet 385



Across all studies, evidence available indicates that mixed-sex audiences are more engaged and productive, both in trainings designed to increase knowledge about issues resulting from GBV, and trainings designed to instigate social norm change. Some studies on the impact of trainings around FGM/C have found them to have some impact on rates of FGM when framed as conversations, rather than the delivery of information.<sup>8</sup> This finding, while relevant for conversations designed to reduce rates of FGM/C, rather than to increase knowledge of legal rights, may have some relevance for legal knowledge-based trainings. The literature also indicates that interventions with statistically significant positive results focused on each topic in-depth instead of briefly covering a range of topics. Finally, it is consistently noted in the literature that one-off trainings are rarely effective.<sup>9</sup> In general, however, the literature is cautious about recommending this intervention, given that it is often poorly implemented and there is insufficient evidence of its overall impact.<sup>10</sup>

### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- Trainings with communities to increase awareness of legal rights and knowledge about how to access the justice system may be effective if they are well designed and assessed. Well-designed training programmes generally include both men and women, focus deeply on one subject rather than a range of issues, are continuous rather than one-off and may be more effective when conducted as conversations rather than the imparting of information.

### **Community Activism**

Most studies on the effectiveness of community activism have interrogated the effect of the intervention on rates of, or attitudes towards, GBV, rather than measuring access to justice for survivors. These interventions have tended to focus on IPV and harmful cultural practices. Their aim is to change social attitudes towards the acceptability of these violations, ultimately contributing to their reduction. These interventions are considered in this section on rights awareness because convincing survivors that what they are experiencing is a legal violation, and that it is acceptable to approach the justice system to resolve it, is likely to involve a similar 'social norms changing' element to the projects addressed through community activism.

One of the reports considered is a systematic review of interventions that involve using community activism to change social norms on VAWG across low-income countries, which included a component on increasing people's knowledge and use of GBV services. It found that where activism encourages the participation and mobilisation of multiple community stakeholders, significant changes have been recorded in the extent to which people knew about and used such services.<sup>11</sup>

In Nepal, the Feminist Dalit Organisation of Nepal (FEDO) implemented a four-year project which aimed to increase the skills of Dalit (a caste that has historically faced discrimination) to advocate

---

<sup>8</sup> L. Heise (2011) 'What Works to Prevent Partner Violence? An evidence overview', STRIVE; DfID (May 2012) 'How to Note: A Practical Guide on Community Programming on Violence against Women and Girls', Violence against Women and Girls CHASE Guidance Note Series.

<sup>9</sup> D. Arango (2014) 'Interventions to Prevent or Reduce Violence Against Women and Girls: A Systematic Review of Reviews' World Bank, p 35; A. Willman (2013) Sexual and Gender-Based Violence: What is the World Bank Doing, and What have We Learned?: A Strategic Review.

<sup>10</sup> Above n 5.

<sup>11</sup> M. Ellsberg et al (2014) 'Prevention of violence against women and girls: what does the evidence say?' Lancet 385, p 1562



for themselves, including in terms of increased access to services and justice in discrimination cases. An evaluation of the project showed that following training and the formation of the women's groups, women had an increased understanding and consciousness of their rights.<sup>12</sup>

Some literature suggests that attitudes to GBV are able to be changed over time by carefully designed, long-term interventions, including at least one experimental study on a project implemented in conflict-affected DRC.<sup>13</sup> Studies on interventions addressing child marriage and FGM/C in contexts that are comparable in the context of these practices (Egypt, Sudan, Ethiopia, Kenya and Senegal) found that activism by people within communities was more effective at achieving results than law reform combined with awareness raising.<sup>14</sup> Though the results measured by these studies relate primarily to attitudinal change, it may be extrapolated that similar results could be expected for interventions designed to increase survivors' access to the justice system. The literature cautions, however, that these types of interventions are difficult to do well.<sup>15</sup>

### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- Where women and marginalised groups demonstrate reluctance to access the justice system, programming relying on the activism of community members who break down stigmas and barriers to approaching formal justice actors may have some impact on legal awareness and use of justice services.
- Awareness raising combined with legal reform on FGM/C has been unsuccessful in other contexts. Interventions aiming to curb rates of FGM/C may be more effective as community-led norm-changing initiatives, rather than approaches that have a justice or security lens.

### **One-stop rape crisis centres**

There is limited research about the impact of one-stop centres in contexts comparable to Somalia. The systematic studies that do exist focus on whether these centres decrease rates of GBV, rather than whether they increase access to justice,<sup>16</sup> although there are also some anecdotal reports that these centres do increase survivors' access to legal and other types of services. Some anecdotal reports from projects in post-conflict countries, including one project across Northern Uganda, South Sudan and Liberia,<sup>17</sup> and another in the former Yugoslavia,<sup>18</sup> demonstrate that if such centres are set up as safe spaces or community centres through which survivors are able to access multi-sectoral support, they can have an impact on increasing access to services. These centres were found to be more impactful than rape crisis centres, both because they did not have the attached stigma of being a service purely for rape survivors, and because they provided multi-sectoral services to survivors, providing entry points to people who may

<sup>12</sup> K4D Helpdesk Report (2020) 'Gender-sensitive security and justice interventions in Sub-Saharan Africa, MENA and South Asia', p 17.

<sup>13</sup> A. Kerr-Wilson (January 2020) 'A rigorous global evidence review of interventions to prevent violence against women and girls' What Works and UK Aid, p 29

<sup>14</sup> D. Arango (2014) 'Interventions to Prevent or Reduce Violence Against Women and Girls: A Systematic Review of Reviews' World Bank, pp 28- 29; L. Heise (2011) 'What Works to Prevent Partner Violence? An evidence overview', STRIVE p 28

<sup>15</sup> A. Kerr-Wilson (January 2020) 'A rigorous global evidence review of interventions to prevent violence against women and girls' What Works and UK Aid, p 29

<sup>16</sup> D. Arango (2014) 'Interventions to Prevent or Reduce Violence Against Women and Girls: A Systematic Review of Reviews' World Bank, p 25

<sup>17</sup> DfID (May 2012) 'How to Note: A Practical Guide on Community Programming on Violence against Women and Girls', Violence against Women and Girls CHASE Guidance Note Series, p 30

<sup>18</sup> A. Willman (2013) Sexual and Gender-Based Violence: What is the World Bank Doing, and What have We Learned?: A Strategic Review, p 20

otherwise not have done so to access legal support. In Northern Uganda, South Sudan and Liberia, these services included documentation of evidence for potential prosecutions.<sup>19</sup> However, these studies did not indicate whether the provision of that service increased tangible justice outcomes, for example by leading to increased prosecutions or convictions.

#### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- One-stop centres are more likely to be utilised by survivors and to be able to reach people with legal services if they provide multiple forms of support and are designed as safe spaces or community centres, rather than 'rape crisis' facilities.
- These centres could play a role in collecting information from survivors to be used in future legal cases.

#### **GBV survivor hotlines**

A systematic review conducted by What Works in 2015 could not find any research on the effectiveness of hotlines in connecting GBV survivors to services. One observational study into the impact of hotlines was found in the US; a non-comparative jurisdiction.<sup>20</sup> There are reports of hotlines being used effectively in Lebanon and South Africa, but the success stories are anecdotal.<sup>21</sup> Since the COVID-19 pandemic, there have been reports from countries across the world of an increased use of GBV hotline services, though no reports could be found indicating the impact this has had on justice outcomes. Given the heavy usage of GBV hotlines globally, there has been some research conducted on how best to provide this service to women who do not have access to a phone. This research includes recommendations to adapt existing physical safe spaces for women and girls into GBV phone booth stations; train other types of service providers to identify and refer GBV incidents; and activate 'alert chains' where women can indicate their need for assistance at places such as grocers and pharmacists, though little evidence appears to exist as yet for the effectiveness of these interventions.<sup>22</sup>

#### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- While there is little evidence of the justice outcomes associated with setting up hotlines, their increased use globally in the time of the pandemic indicates that they can be seen as a useful service by survivors. Such interventions should be approached with caution, and consideration should also be given to how to reach survivors without phone access.

#### **Screening and Referrals**

Some interventions have focused on screening women (e.g. when accessing medical services) to determine whether they may have experienced GBV at certain points in their lifetime and refer them for further support.<sup>23</sup> The results of this approach have been mixed, and studies have been

<sup>19</sup> DfID (May 2012) 'How to Note: A Practical Guide on Community Programming on Violence against Women and Girls', Violence against Women and Girls CHASE Guidance Note Series, p 30

<sup>20</sup> R. Jewkes et al (September 2015) 'What works to prevent violence against women and girls - Evidence Reviews' What Works, available at [https://resourcecentre.savethechildren.net/node/11880/pdf/2015\\_ww\\_evidence\\_review\\_3.pdf](https://resourcecentre.savethechildren.net/node/11880/pdf/2015_ww_evidence_review_3.pdf)

<sup>21</sup> UN Women et al (April 2020) 'Gender Alert on COVID-19 Lebanon' available at [https://lebanon.unfpa.org/sites/default/files/pub-pdf/Gender%20Alert%20on%20COVID%20Lebanon\\_%20FINAL.pdf](https://lebanon.unfpa.org/sites/default/files/pub-pdf/Gender%20Alert%20on%20COVID%20Lebanon_%20FINAL.pdf)

<sup>22</sup> UNICEF (2020) 'Not just hotlines and mobile phones: GBV Service provision during COVID-19', available at <https://www.unicef.org/media/68086/file/GBV%20Service%20Provision%20During%20COVID-19.pdf>

<sup>23</sup> D. Arango (2014) 'Interventions to Prevent or Reduce Violence Against Women and Girls: A Systematic Review of Reviews' World Bank, p 34; A. Kerr-Wilson (January 2020) 'A rigorous global evidence review of interventions to prevent violence against women and girls' What Works and UK Aid p 42

limited to high-income countries.<sup>24</sup> The prevalence of FGM/C and high rates of sexual abuse against children in Somalia translate to high numbers of sexual violence survivors who need significant medical support, making screening during medical processes a potentially relevant intervention, but significantly more research is needed to determine how this would work and what impact it would have in the Somali context.

#### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- This type of intervention requires further research.

#### **Legal reform**

There has been a wave of legal reform related to GBV since the 1990s. Many countries, low to high income, across the world, have passed legislation that more strictly and comprehensively criminalises sexual violence and introduces criminal sanctions for practices that were previously not illegal, including domestic violence and harmful cultural practices. Some qualitative research has been conducted on what strategies have been effective in pushing through these legal changes, which has found advocating for countries to bring their domestic law into conformity with their international law obligations to be an effective approach.<sup>25</sup>

The literature cautions that there is no research indicating that legal reforms lead to increases in access to justice in the form of increased arrests, prosecutions or convictions of GBV cases, or that they have had the effect of reducing the occurrence of GBV.<sup>26</sup> As noted by Ellsberg et al, 'system-wide changes are needed to improve the enforcement of laws', rather than law reform and trainings alone.<sup>27</sup> The World Bank further warns that while it is often argued that legislation against GBV sends an important message about the non-acceptability of such conduct, even if it is not fully enforced, there is limited evidence to support this contention in practice.<sup>28</sup>

#### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- As Somalia has ratified the Convention on the Rights of the Child other relevant instruments,<sup>29</sup> although it has not yet ratified the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women, the approach of advocating around Somalia's international obligations may be of relevance to those campaigning for the adoption of the Sexual Offences Bill and other GBV legislation.
- SSJP2 programme designers should be cognisant that the passage of these pieces of legislation alone will be unlikely to have an impact on increasing access to justice or security for survivors. A holistic approach to implementation will be necessary.

#### **Trainings with the Police on addressing GBV**

Trainings with the police on responding to GBV cases is often a key component of interventions designed to improve access to justice and security for GBV survivors. A DFID funded review conducted in XX concluded that 'there is a small, but growing, evidence base that police training can help improve knowledge of how to receive, investigate and prosecute cases of SGBV, as well as how to support survivors. However, there is limited rigorous evidence that training can improve

<sup>24</sup> Ibid: all results are limited to high-income countries

<sup>25</sup> L. Heise (2011) 'What Works to Prevent Partner Violence? An evidence overview', STRIVE, p 72.

<sup>26</sup> L. Heise (2011) 'What Works to Prevent Partner Violence? An evidence overview', STRIVE, M. Ellsberg et al (2014) 'Prevention of violence against women and girls: what does the evidence say?' Lancet 385, World Bank

<sup>27</sup> M. Ellsberg et al (2014) 'Prevention of violence against women and girls: what does the evidence say?' Lancet 385, p 1558.

<sup>28</sup> A. Willman (2013) Sexual and Gender-Based Violence: What is the World Bank Doing, and What have We Learned?: A Strategic Review, p 24

<sup>29</sup> Convention Against Torture, International Covenant of Civil and Political Rights, African Charter of Human and People's Rights.

the speed or rate of convictions, or prevent violence'. A review conducted in 2015 found some evidence in qualitative studies of trainings bringing about positive changes in the attitude and behaviour of police towards women and girl survivors of violence.<sup>30</sup> Some studies have assessed the success of trainings in terms of increased understanding of the trainees and buy-in from the policing institution: an output rather than outcome or impact-level measurement. These studies have emphasised the need for ownership of the training at senior levels of the police; trainers that involve both police personnel and external experts; trainings for decision-makers as well as operational police; and the need for long-term rather than one-off or short-term interventions.<sup>31</sup>

#### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- Given the significant capacity gaps within the police, police training on GBV is necessary. However, the literature indicates it is likely to have an impact only if there is buy-in from the top levels of the police, is co-conducted with police trainers, and is conducted as a long-term programme involving a continuous relationship with the police, rather than one-off or short-term interventions.

#### **Mobile Courts**

Mobile courts have been introduced to numerous countries with limited court infrastructure in order to help accessing communities that are rural, remote, displaced or lack the financial resources to access the formal justice system. There is very limited evidence about the impact of this intervention. An observational study by the South African Litigation Centre on the effectiveness of mobile gender courts in the DRC found that 20 travelling courts heard 382 cases, with 204 rape convictions, 82 convictions for other crimes and 67 acquittals in three years. As these cases were heard in communities without courts, it is assumed that these survivors would otherwise not have been able to access the legal system at all, though this is not stated explicitly in the report.<sup>32</sup> A systematic assessment conducted in 2014 found that there was insufficient evidence for the impact of mobile courts, although the study focused on decreasing rates of GBV, rather than increasing access to justice.<sup>33</sup>

#### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- The DRC model shows some promising results which may be relevant to the Somali context, but more research is required to determine whether and how that model can be scaled and replicated.

---

<sup>30</sup> Ibid.

<sup>31</sup> L. Heise (2011) 'What Works to Prevent Partner Violence? An evidence overview', STRIVE; A. Willman (2013) Sexual and Gender-Based Violence: What is the World Bank Doing, and What have We Learned?: A Strategic Review

<sup>32</sup> SALC 'DRC- Complementarity in Action The Mobile Gender Courts', available at <https://www.southernafricalitigationcentre.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/Case-Study-DRC-Mobile-Gender-Courts.pdf>

<sup>33</sup> D. Arango (2014) 'Interventions to Prevent or Reduce Violence Against Women and Girls: A Systematic Review of Reviews' World Bank , p 27.

### *Community-orientated policing*

Community policing encompasses numerous strategies and activities and is ultimately aimed at fostering a partnership between the police and the community through which security concerns are collaboratively identified and resolved. According to the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR), community policing 'can be a highly useful tool in improving relations between law enforcement and minority communities.' Undertaking community policing in a way that responds to the needs of minorities includes holding regular public discussions in minority communities to facilitate the communication of complaints, and then communicating what action has been taken to address them.<sup>34</sup> While community policing approaches have been increasingly used in conflict and post-conflict contexts, there are few evaluation studies using controlled experiment approaches to determine their effectiveness.<sup>35</sup>

One experimental and one quasi-experimental study in conflict contexts were found in the course of this review. An experimental study was conducted in Papua New Guinea in 2015 and found that community policing increased demand for police presence; increased reporting of GBV; and reduced the perceived prevalence of GBV, along with other types of crimes.<sup>36</sup> The quasi-experimental study, conducted in the DRC in 2019, found that community policing interventions impacted strongly on both community access to policing services and police legitimacy.<sup>37</sup> While the study found that the intervention did increase women's perceptions of security, it was significantly more impactful in this respect for men than women, and that the change in perceptions of younger women was negligible. The intervention set up security councils in different districts, each of which were comprised of 10 representatives from the police, neighbourhood chiefs, the local administration and civil society. These councils were tasked with running a diagnostic of security issues, designing and adopting a prevention plan to tackle insecurity in the areas they oversee. The project also set up community forums, established in groupings of neighbourhoods in the district, where issues of policing are discussed, demands from the community are formulated, and information is disseminated from the police and neighbourhood chiefs.<sup>38</sup>

#### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- This model may have some interesting lessons learned for Somalia, where some limited trainings and interventions on community policing have been introduced. It must be noted, however, that these observations come from only one quasi-observational study, and further research is needed to understand how a comprehensive community policing model would operate in Somalia in practice.
- Community policing models in Somalia will need to be carefully designed so as to respond to the different and increased needs of women and marginalised groups, and to respond to the intersectional barriers to security that these groups face (eg due to age, disability, displacement, etc).

---

<sup>34</sup> OHCHR (2013) 'Participation of Minorities in Policing: Community Policing as a Good Practice' available at <https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/Minorities/ParticipationOfMinoritiesInPolicing.pdf>

<sup>35</sup> D. Wisler (2019) 'Impacts of community policing on security: evidence from Mbujimayi in the Democratic Republic of Congo' Police Practice and Research

<sup>36</sup> J-Pal et al (July 2019) 'Governance, crime, and conflict initiative: Lessons from randomized evaluations on managing and preventing crime, violence, and conflict', p 5.

<sup>37</sup> Above n 41.

<sup>38</sup> Ibid.



### **Women and Minorities in Policing**

While many best-practice guides and manuals advocate the positive effects of including women in the police force in significant numbers, there is limited research as to what effect this has in practice. As noted by Todak et al, 'the scarcity of research on female police officers is a consequence of the low representation of women in the profession' globally.<sup>39</sup> It has likewise been identified as policing good practice to ensure minority group representation in police forces. Though the OHCHR has argued that 'experiences demonstrate that minority representation in the police leads to much more efficient police work', there is little publicly available research to support this contention.<sup>40</sup>

In terms of research in contexts comparable to Somalia, this review found two quasi-experimental studies on the effect of increasing women in policing in Liberia and Papua New Guinea, and one on the effect of increasing minorities in policing in Liberia.<sup>41</sup> In Liberia, the study found that while including women on policing teams increased the cohesion of those units, it did not make the unit any more effective or sensitive in handling GBV cases. The study found that the most relevant determining factor for whether a unit effectively handled such cases was their overall technical competence, rather than the gender composition or any other factor. In Papua New Guinea, a study on the introduction of uniformed community police officers in rural Papua New Guinea found that the presence of any community police officer increased the probability that incidents of violence against women would be reported, and this was particularly true when the officer was female.<sup>42</sup>

The study on minorities in policing in Liberia found that the addition of minorities to police units in fact made those units slightly more discriminatory to the represented ethnic minority than teams without minority representation. The study examined a cohort of just 232 police officers, and its authors caution against extrapolating wider conclusions based on its findings.<sup>43</sup> Ultimately, there is insufficient evidence to determine what impact including women and minorities in policing has, in part because of their underrepresentation in police forces around the world.

#### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- Appointing female and minority group police officers will alone be insufficient to increase access to justice for these groups. Tokenistic measures- whether increasing representation of these groups, setting up gender desks or conducting on-off trainings on issues effecting women and marginalised groups- are ineffective.

### **Coordinated Community Response**

Coordinated Community Response (CCR) refers to a type of intervention which aims to give community members greater decision-making power over the security of their communities. These programmes generally involve the creation of CCR councils, which meet regularly to identify weaknesses in systems that respond to security threats, devise strategies to respond to these weaknesses, and track the progress of these initiatives. The difference between this type

<sup>39</sup> Todak et al (2012) 'Prospective Female Officer Perceptions of Policing'

[https://www.researchgate.net/publication/265117513\\_PROSPECTIVE\\_FEMALE\\_OFFICER\\_PERCEPTIONS\\_OF\\_POLICING](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/265117513_PROSPECTIVE_FEMALE_OFFICER_PERCEPTIONS_OF_POLICING)

<sup>40</sup> OHCHR (2013) 'Participation of Minorities in Policing: Community Policing as a Good Practice', available at

<https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/Minorities/ParticipationOfMinoritiesInPolicing.pdf>

<sup>41</sup> J-Pal et al (July 2019) 'Governance, crime, and conflict initiative: Lessons from randomized evaluations on managing and preventing crime, violence, and conflict', p 11.

<sup>42</sup> C Nolan, A. Knox, & N. Kenny (2019), 'Governance, crime and conflict initiative: Lessons from randomised evaluations on managing and preventing crime, violence and conflict', GCCI. [https://www.povertyactionlab.org/sites/default/files/review-paper/gcc\\_i\\_evidence-review\\_july-2019.pdf](https://www.povertyactionlab.org/sites/default/files/review-paper/gcc_i_evidence-review_july-2019.pdf)

<sup>43</sup> Ibid.

of response and community policing is that CCR models are based within, and driven by, lay community members, whereas community policing models are based within, and driven by, the police. These interventions may complement each other. The exact activities of CCR councils vary depending on context. Some may track legal cases and proactively engage the police, courts and crisis services for victims of crime.<sup>44</sup> These councils have predominantly been established in the US, Latin America and some parts of Asia (i.e. contexts that are not comparable to Somalia).<sup>45</sup> One systematic review and one theoretical research report were found on this approach, neither of which contained examples from comparable contexts. One study provided anecdotal example from Ghana, which suggested some positive impact on both reducing community violence and changing attitudes to women's rights and GBV.<sup>46</sup> More comprehensive research from the US suggests that CCR councils may improve coordination of services and improve perpetrator accountability, but do not increase women's access to services or reduce overall levels of GBV.<sup>47</sup>

#### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- There is insufficient evidence to speculate on how such programmes may work in Somalia, but this approach warrants further research and consideration.

#### **Gender Desks**

There is no evidence that gender desks at police stations have had a practical impact on increasing the ability of survivors to access justice, security or protection through the police. Systematic reviews have not included studies specifically looking into the impact of gender desks. Individual organisations have conducted assessments into their effectiveness in Tanzania<sup>48</sup> and Kenya,<sup>49</sup> which are African and low-income but otherwise not directly comparable. These studies found that the gender desks were ineffective at increasing reporting of GBV. However, they also generally found that the programmes were insufficiently funded and resourced. Both studies recommended that to increase the effectiveness of the gender desks, more holistic approaches and significantly more funding would need to be dedicated.

#### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- Gender desks at police stations are unlikely to be effective unless they are a part of a more comprehensive, and well-funded, holistic policing programme.

#### **Women Police Stations**

The first women's police station opened in Sao Paulo, Brazil, in 1985, and they have since been established in several low and middle income countries, primarily in Asia and Latin America, in an attempt to provide specialised services to facilitate women's access to justice in cases of GBV.<sup>50</sup> Women's police stations may be physical stations or specialised units which are designed to serve female justice users, are usually staffed by female police personnel, and provide specialised services to GBV survivors. They may raise awareness and receive complaints;

<sup>44</sup> L. Heise (2011) 'What Works to Prevent Partner Violence? An evidence overview', STRIVE, p 79.

<sup>45</sup> Ibid, DfID (May 2012) 'How to Note: A Practical Guide on Community Programming on Violence against Women and Girls', Violence against Women and Girls CHASE Guidance Note Series

<sup>46</sup> DfID (May 2012) 'How to Note: A Practical Guide on Community Programming on Violence against Women and Girls', Violence against Women and Girls CHASE Guidance Note Series, p 28

<sup>47</sup> Ibid.

<sup>48</sup> Mussa et al (2019) 'Challenges Facing Police Gender and Children's Desks in Reduction of Gender-Based Violence and Violence against Children: A Case of Kinondoni District, Dar Es Salaam Region, Tanzania' The International Journal of Humanities & Social Studies 7:8

<sup>49</sup> W. A. Ndungu (2016) 'The effectiveness of police gender desks in addressing gender based violence: a case of Nyandarua County - Kenya' available at <https://ir-library.ku.ac.ke/handle/123456789/17630>

<sup>50</sup> L. Heise (2011) 'What Works to Prevent Partner Violence? An evidence overview', STRIVE, p 76



provide support in accessing healthcare, counselling and financial assistance; and initiate legal action.<sup>51</sup> There have been no studies on the impact of women police stations in contexts comparable to Somalia. A book-length evaluation on their impact in Brazil, Ecuador, Nicaragua and Peru found that they have not had a substantial impact on increasing women's access to justice.<sup>52</sup> There is evidence from theoretical research reports that these stations are effective in increasing public awareness about GBV,<sup>53</sup> and at least one report seems to suggest that they may have increased the number of women reporting offences.<sup>54</sup> However, the evidence is extremely limited, and restricted to non-comparable contexts.

#### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- Women police stations, though constituting a more comprehensive approach than gender desks in police stations, are still unlikely by themselves to make a significant difference on women's access to justice. While they may increase public awareness of services, there are also other, less intensive interventions that have this effect, outlined in Section 1.1.

#### **Special Courts**

Special courts for GBV aim to fast-track cases and provide specialised legal services to survivors. This review found some assessments indicating such courts appear to have increased arrest and conviction rates, but these were limited to non-comparative jurisdictions, mostly high-income countries, as well as one in South Africa.<sup>55</sup> There is insufficient evidence available to extrapolate findings to the Somali context.

#### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- This approach requires further research.

#### **Paralegals**

Community-based paralegals were introduced in post-war Liberia and Sierra Leone in the early 2000s and have since been introduced in numerous low-income and post-conflict contexts since. Paralegals provide basic justice services in places characterised by dysfunctional court systems and low numbers of lawyers, like Somalia. 'Paralegals' in this context are community members who are formally trained and who use an array of tools—both legal and non-legal—to provide justice services, under the general supervision of a lawyer.<sup>56</sup> According to the Open Society Foundation, 'community-based paralegals may bring together skill sets belonging to diverse professions, such as social workers, mediators, educators, traditional community leaders, interpreters, administrators, and lawyers, with the added value applying these skills according to the specific needs of the situation and the community.'<sup>57</sup> Some interventions focused specifically

<sup>51</sup> R. Jewkes et al (September 2015) 'What works to prevent violence against women and girls - Evidence Reviews' What Works, available at [https://resourcecentre.savethechildren.net/node/11880/pdf/2015\\_ww\\_evidence\\_review\\_3.pdf](https://resourcecentre.savethechildren.net/node/11880/pdf/2015_ww_evidence_review_3.pdf)

<sup>52</sup> N. Jubb, N et al (2010) 'Women's Police Stations in Latin America: An Entry Point for Stopping Violence and Gaining Access to Justice' Quito, Ecuador: Centre for Planning and Social Studies.

<sup>53</sup> L. Heise (2011) 'What Works to Prevent Partner Violence? An evidence overview', STRIVE; A. Willman (2013) Sexual and Gender-Based Violence: What is the World Bank Doing, and What have We Learned?: A Strategic Review,

<sup>54</sup> L. Heise (2011) 'What Works to Prevent Partner Violence? An evidence overview', STRIVE.

<sup>55</sup> Above n 46.

<sup>56</sup> Open Society Foundations (2010) 'Community-based Paralegals: A Practitioner's Guide', available at [www.a4id.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/04/Community-Based-Paralegals-A-Practitioners-Guide.pdf](http://www.a4id.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/04/Community-Based-Paralegals-A-Practitioners-Guide.pdf)

<sup>57</sup> Ibid, p 18.

on GBV have described paralegals as 'intermediaries' or 'victim advocates'.<sup>58</sup> Paralegals in this role are specifically trained on identifying and accessing GBV services, and are assigned to survivors to support them in navigating these processes.<sup>59</sup>

One systematic global review found that there is evidence to support the position that paralegals have been generally effective at increasing women's access to justice, though it is unclear if the contexts assessed included those comparable to Somalia.<sup>60</sup> A 2011 observational study on the impact of paralegals in post-war Liberia, considered a comparable context, found that engagement with paralegals 'strongly impacted' the legal knowledge of those accessing their services; that there was an increase in the reporting of disputes; an increase in tangible and just outcomes to the disputes; and decreases in the number of people having to pay bribes, indicating that 'paralegal involvement may lower the corruption costs of access to justice through the formal system'.<sup>61</sup> There are numerous anecdotal reports of paralegal programmes having similar successes in other jurisdictions which, while not directly comparative, have certain similarities, such as Kenya,<sup>62</sup> Uganda<sup>63</sup> and South Africa<sup>64</sup> and Nepal.

### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- There is enough evidence of a positive impact for women and marginalised groups in terms of accessing justice through paralegal programmes to consider scaling up such approaches in Somalia.
- Programme designers working on paralegal programmes in Somalia may consider consulting Open Society's Practitioner's Guide to Community-Based Paralegals when designing interventions.<sup>65</sup>

### **Alternative Dispute Resolution**

Global studies on alternative dispute resolution (ADR) as a means to deliver better quality justice to women and minorities generally focus on out-of-court mediation in high income countries, rather than the type of ADR programme delivered in Somalia. Research into ADR in contexts similar to Somalia primarily takes the form of theoretical research, and some observational studies. The studies reviewed for this report were drawn from Ghana, Ethiopia and Nigeria, and record both increases in the number of cases resolved through ADR systems and high rates of satisfaction amongst women using ADR processes.<sup>66</sup> However, as noted in a 2015 'What Works' report, there is vagueness around the concept of user satisfaction, and these studies do not look

<sup>58</sup> D. Arango (2014) 'Interventions to Prevent or Reduce Violence Against Women and Girls: A Systematic Review of Reviews' World Bank, p 25, 34

<sup>59</sup> Ibid

<sup>60</sup> R. Jewkes et al (September 2015) 'What works to prevent violence against women and girls - Evidence Reviews' What Works, available at [https://resourcecentre.savethechildren.net/node/11880/pdf/2015\\_ww\\_evidence\\_review\\_3.pdf](https://resourcecentre.savethechildren.net/node/11880/pdf/2015_ww_evidence_review_3.pdf)

<sup>61</sup> P. Chapman and C. Payne (2018) 'The Contributions of Community-Based Paralegals in Delivering Access to Justice in Postwar Liberia' in Community Paralegals and the Pursuit of Justice, available at <https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/community-paralegals-and-the-pursuit-of-justice/contributions-of-communitybased-paralegals-in-delivering-access-to-justice-in-postwar-liberia/5552F830B380EDDE72259A4C0B21F434/core-reader>

<sup>62</sup> A. Moy (2018) 'Kenya's Community-Based Paralegals' in Community Paralegals and the Pursuit of Justice, available at <https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/community-paralegals-and-the-pursuit-of-justice/contributions-of-communitybased-paralegals-in-delivering-access-to-justice-in-postwar-liberia/5552F830B380EDDE72259A4C0B21F434/core-reader>

<sup>63</sup> S. Krueger (2013) 'Justice on Wheels', available at <https://www.opensocietyfoundations.org/voices/justice-wheels>

<sup>64</sup> C. Friedman and W. Martins (2015) 'Impact of Community-Based Paralegals: Work in Perspective' Namati, available at <https://namati.org/resources/impact-of-community-based-paralegals-work-in-perspective/>

<sup>65</sup> Open Society Foundations (2010) 'Community-based Paralegals: A Practitioner's Guide', available at [www.a4id.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/04/Community-Based-Paralegals-A-Practitioners-Guide.pdf](http://www.a4id.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/04/Community-Based-Paralegals-A-Practitioners-Guide.pdf)

<sup>66</sup> E. Uazie (2011) 'Alternative Dispute Resolution in Africa: Preventing Conflict and Enhancing Stability' available at <https://africacenter.org/publication/alternative-dispute-resolution-in-africa-preventing-conflict-and-enhancing-stability/>

at longer-term outcomes, or provide nuanced information about the experience of the user throughout the process.<sup>67</sup> These studies also focus on the satisfaction of women with ADR processes, and do not make any findings about the inclusion of minorities.

#### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- The global research in this area does not provide a significantly greater evidence base than the research conducted in Somalia. The impact of ADR interventions on increasing access to justice for women and marginalised groups globally is unclear.

#### **Non-justice/ security interventions**

Most of the literature consulted for this review assesses the impact of interventions on the reduction of rates of GBV, rather than on the ability of survivors to access justice or the link between increased reporting and reduction in GBV. These reports include assessments of non-legal sector interventions which have been effective at reducing GBV. Effective GBV prevention programming requires a variety of intervention types. The literature suggests that justice and security interventions should be accompanied where possible with other programmes addressing other root causes of violence. Non-security and justice interventions have therefore been considered in this review as programmes which could be implemented alongside or in a complementary manner to security and justice programmes. The types of interventions considered in this report are economic empowerment programmes, couples and parenting programmes, and school-based interventions.

Many organisations have experimented with different types of economic interventions with survivors and their families in an effort to both reduce GBV within the home and to increase a woman's options after she has been subjected to sexual or gendered violations. There is significantly more evidence available for these types of interventions than there are for legal and justice sector interventions.

As noted by Kerr-Wilson, the relationship between poverty and GBV is bi-directional: poverty is a key risk factor for GBV; and GBV make survivors poorer.<sup>68</sup> Programmes considered in the review include both those with the reduction of GBV as a primary aim, and those which reduce or hope to reduce GBV as a secondary effect. These types of programmes generally take one of three forms: cash transfers; microfinance, savings or livelihood interventions; and combined economic and social-empowerment interventions.<sup>69</sup>

There is enough evidence available through systematic reviews to conclude that cash transfers are effective in reducing both intimate partner violence and child marriage in the immediate-term, though insufficient evidence to make conclusions about its long-term effect. There is less evidence for the effect of these interventions in jurisdictions comparable to Somalia. However, an experimental study conducted in Mali found that cash transfers specifically had the effect of reducing IPV amongst women in polygamous relationships, with the biggest changes effecting

<sup>67</sup> R. Jewkes et al (September 2015) 'What works to prevent violence against women and girls - Evidence Reviews' What Works, available at [https://resourcecentre.savethechildren.net/node/11880/pdf/2015\\_ww\\_evidence\\_review\\_3.pdf](https://resourcecentre.savethechildren.net/node/11880/pdf/2015_ww_evidence_review_3.pdf), p 27

<sup>68</sup> A. Kerr-Wilson (January 2020) 'A rigorous global evidence review of interventions to prevent violence against women and girls' What Works and UK Aid, p 11

<sup>69</sup> A. Kerr-Wilson (January 2020) 'A rigorous global evidence review of interventions to prevent violence against women and girls' What Works and UK Aid; M. Ellsberg et al (2014) 'Prevention of violence against women and girls: what does the evidence say?' Lancet 385; L. Heise (2011) 'What Works to Prevent Partner Violence? An evidence overview', STRIVE

second wives.<sup>70</sup> The available evidence on microfinance, savings and livelihood interventions is mixed, though more recent studies conclude that these programmes do not significantly impact rates of GBV.<sup>71</sup> The results of a combination of economic and social empowerment interventions are also mixed, but more promising for being able to reduce rates of GBV. These activities comprise of either short-term, 'two-component' interventions which combine economic empowerment activities with trainings or sessions aimed to increase confidence or challenge gender norms; or longer term, multi-component interventions which target intersecting vulnerabilities. These may include, for example, safe spaces, awareness raising activities, vocational training, or any other combination of programming aiming to address underlying risk factors of violence.<sup>72</sup> The evidence indicates that short-term, two-component interventions may have some impact in women over 30, but that longer term, multi component interventions are needed to produce results for adolescents and young women. The evidence is primarily from countries not comparable to Somalia, but includes experimental studies with promising results in Afghanistan and the Ivory Coast.<sup>73</sup>

#### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- Justice and security programme designers should look for opportunities to partner with, or complement the programming of, organisations undertaking economic interventions for the purpose of reducing rates of GBV.

#### **Couples and Parenting Programmes**

Numerous studies have focused on the impact of interventions aimed at couples or the family unit. Couple interventions generally consist of either intensive community programming with a focus on increasing positive relations between couples, or brief health-based interventions with couples in a clinical setting. Parenting interventions refer to programming promoting health, respectful and rights-based parenting practices. This review considers programmes of this type that include a focus on addressing GBV within the home. Systematic reviews suggest that both types of programmes can be effective in reducing GBV. However, none of these studies were conducted into contexts comparable to Somalia.<sup>74</sup>

#### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- There is not enough evidence to suggest that justice and security programmers should look for ways to complement the programming of organisations working with couples and on parenting.

---

<sup>70</sup> A. Kerr-Wilson (January 2020) 'A rigorous global evidence review of interventions to prevent violence against women and girls' What Works and UK Aid, p 12

<sup>71</sup> Ibid; L. Heise (2011) 'What Works to Prevent Partner Violence? An evidence overview', STRIVE, M. Ellsberg et al (2014) 'Prevention of violence against women and girls: what does the evidence say?' Lancet 385

<sup>72</sup> Above n 67, p 16.

<sup>73</sup> Ibid; M. Ellsberg et al (2014) 'Prevention of violence against women and girls: what does the evidence say?' Lancet 385

<sup>74</sup> A. Kerr-Wilson (January 2020) 'A rigorous global evidence review of interventions to prevent violence against women and girls' What Works and UK Aid.

### School-Based Interventions

School-based interventions take a variety of forms, and include activities designed to build the skillset of school-aged children and adolescents to resolve conflict non-violently, and critical reflections on gender roles which aim to promote healthy attitudes at an early age. A comprehensive systematic global review found that the most effective interventions combine these approaches, and aim to transform gender roles over long-term, sustained engagement. This review concluded that school-based interventions can have some effect in reducing rates of GBV, if they are well-implemented, long-term projects. It included one quasi-experimental study which had a positive impact on reducing rates of GBV from Afghanistan.<sup>75</sup>

#### *Implications for design of SSJP2*

- Where there is overlap between programmes aiming to increase access to justice and security and programmes intended to transform social norms, programme designers may consider finding ways to support or complement school-based interventions on gender equality and social inclusion.

## 5. Gaps in the evidence base

The most significant gaps in the research considered for this review is first, the dearth of comprehensive or rigorous research on effective interventions in contexts comparable to Somalia; second, the fact that most of the evidence on GBV interventions focuses on their impact in reducing GBV, rather than on increasing access to justice; and third, the research is primarily concerned with access to justice for women for GBV cases, to the exclusion of other types of groups and other types of violations.

In terms of the seven types of interventions considered for this review, an analysis of the strength of evidence is as follows:

1. **Interventions to increase legal awareness:** almost all of the research on interventions focused on awareness raising is related to the success of these projects either in changing mindsets and transforming social norms, or on decreasing certain types of GBV. Even where studies include findings related to increases in awareness of legal rights or knowledge of services, these are mentioned only as an outcome of awareness raising activities not designed specifically for this purpose. The overall strength of the evidence that these activities are able to increase legal knowledge is weak; and the evidence that these legal awareness raising activities lead to tangible justice outcomes is non-existent.
2. **Entry points to the justice system:** There is no reliable evidence about what works to increase access to the formal justice system in contexts comparable to Somalia.
3. **Infrastructure, skills and resources:** The evidence base for the impact of interventions under this section is greater than the previous two sections. There are systematic reviews available for the impact of law reform initiatives and police training programmes. The quality of the evidence is unclear, but the body is sizeable enough to be able to draw

---

<sup>75</sup> Ibid, p 37

conclusions about the impact of these interventions, which unfortunately appears to be limited.

4. **Community-orientated policing:** There is a substantial amount of information available about community policing, but significantly less research that disaggregates results by gender in comparative contexts. The small number of anecdotal reports which have been relied on do not constitute a large enough evidence base to be able to extrapolate clear findings for the Somali context;
5. **Interventions to provide specialised justice services for women:** The literature on gender desks, special courts and women's police stations was reviewed. Very little information about the impact of these interventions in contexts comparable to Somalia is available.
6. **Interventions with the informal justice sector:** The review considers community-based paralegals and interventions related to alternative dispute resolution (ADR). There is some evidence available about paralegals in comparative contexts. Much less information exists about ADR.
7. **Non-justice and security interventions:** There is substantial evidence available about these types of interventions, including a moderate amount in comparative contexts.

## 6. Implications for future S&J programming and research in Somalia

While this review generally concludes that there is insufficient evidence available for any of the interventions considered, the research does point to interesting strategies warranting further consideration and research. Some of these findings are that programmes already underway in Somalia may be modified in order to take into account lessons learned in comparative jurisdictions. Others are that interventions that have not been made in Somalia may have some relevance, and could be either further researched or experimented with as pilot projects.

These findings can be summarised as followed:

- There is some evidence from comparative jurisdictions that **awareness campaigns and edutainment** are able to increase knowledge of legal rights and services amongst community members, and that trainings with mixed gender groups have the greatest impact. Community activism may have some impact if implemented carefully and with a nuanced understanding of the context. These interventions cannot be standalone programmes, as they are intended to increase awareness of legal rights and services that also need to be established and developed. They should be implemented as part of a comprehensive programme that simultaneously increases the quality of services and community access to them.
- With the exception of community paralegals, described in the section below, there is no evidence of whether any of the **entry points to the justice system**, such as hotlines of screenings by other service providers, have increased people's access to justice in comparative jurisdictions.



- The literature is clear that **law reform** on its own has **no impact on increasing access to justice**. A holistic approach is required, combining multiple versions of the interventions considered in this review. **Trainings with police** and **mobile courts** are interventions, which are already underway in Somalia, may form part of this approach, but there is little evidence of their impact.
- **Community policing is an effective strategy** in many jurisdictions, including some comparative contexts. Implementing it in Somalia will require custom-designing interventions to the context. There is no evidence of what works to ensure women and minorities are well-served by community policing endeavours. There is **no evidence as yet that increasing their representation in the police force** will have this effect.
- There is **no evidence that gender desks, special courts or women's police stations have been effective** at increasing access to justice for women in comparative contexts. These initiatives have often been under-funded and poorly implemented. Similar interventions in Somalia should not be undertaken unless they are adequately funded and robustly resourced and supported.
- **Community-based paralegals have been an effective model for increasing access to justice** for women and minorities in comparative contexts. While some paralegal models exist in Somalia, they could be strengthened by being better aligned to international best practice standards, looking at examples from the DRC for relevant lessons learnt. There is insufficient evidence about the impact of ADR on increasing access to justice for women and marginalised groups.
- The literature supports the view that security and justice programming may have the most impact on reducing rates of GBV if **complemented by non-justice programming** that has been demonstrated to be effective in addressing GBV. The literature indicates that economic empowerment programmes that have a social empowerment dimension and school-based interventions have been effective in jurisdictions comparable to Somalia.



