

**SSJP Learning and Evidence Literature Review** 

# Evidence from Social Norms Interventions in Fragile and Conflict-affected Situations (FCAS)

April 2021

#### 1.Introduction

Given the limited work to-date on social norms in Somalia, donor programming could benefit from a better understanding of social norms research and interventions that have emerged from other conflict-affected contexts. Therefore, the aim of this literature review is to identify social norms that relate to both corruption and the access and provision of security and justice (S&J) in fragile and conflict-affected states (FCAS). The literature review also reviews the evidence from social norms interventions in FCAS in the areas of anti-corruption, S&J or broader service delivery (e.g., health and gender). Given the obvious cultural and political differences across FCAS, it should be noted that the findings from this literature review are not necessarily applicable to Somalia.

Social norms can be understood as "the shared beliefs within a social unit about the appropriate ways to think, feel, and behave in a given context." Social norms differ from individual beliefs and attitudes and can be subdivided into "beliefs about how others expect one to behave" (injunctive norms) and "beliefs about how others behave" (descriptive norms).

Evidence suggests that social norms are likely to have more influence than institutional factors in FCAS, when compared to stable democracies.<sup>3</sup> As a consequence, the role of factors such as social networks, personal connections and behaviour gain relevance in FCAS<sup>4</sup>. Therefore, standard strategies such as enacting laws, enforcement, transparency, or accountability can be more challenging to implement in these contexts<sup>5</sup>.

This review is structured around three sections. The first section summarises the social norms identified in the literature across FCAS related to corruption and to S&J. The second section examines the evidence from social norms interventions and studies in the areas of corruption and S&J. Finally, the third and last section addresses gaps, possible intervention areas for SSJP, and broader implications for in-country research.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Robert Cialdini, Melanie Trost. 'Social Influence: Social Norms, Conformity and Compliance.' In: *The Handbook of Social Psychology* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1998).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Peggy Chekroun. 'Social Control Behavior: The Effects of Social Situations and Personal Implication on Informal Social Sanctions.' *Soc Personal Psychol Compass.* 2.6 (2008), 2141-58.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> D. Jackson and Nils C. Köbis, 'Anti-Corruption through a Social Norms Lens', *U4 Issue*, 2018,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Cheyanne Scharbatke-Church and Diana Chigas, 'Understanding Social Norms: A Reference Guide for Policy and Practice', 2019, p. 84 <a href="https://sites.tufts.edu/ihs/social-norms-reference-guide/">https://sites.tufts.edu/ihs/social-norms-reference-guide/</a>>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Scharbatke-Church and Chigas.

#### 2. Social Norms relating to corruption and S&J in FCAS

The aim of this first section is to identify social norms that relate directly or indirectly to corruption and/or S&J in FCAS. The methodology and search strategy used to identify papers for inclusion in this review can be found in Appendix 1.

#### Overview of Findings

This literature review only identified studies from nine FCAS contexts: Afghanistan, Burundi, the Central African Republic (CAR), the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC), Libya, Nigeria, the Occupied Palestinian Territories, South Sudan, and Yemen. As noted above, Somalia has been excluded from this paper as it has been analysed in a separate section of the overall SSJP literature review. A summary table of the social norms findings can be found in Appendix 2.

The social norms identified in this review were found to have different strengths of influence. The study findings complement previous research undertaken by Cislaghi & Heise (2018), who proposed four levels of normative strength<sup>6</sup>. This *theory of normative spectrum* is summarised as follows<sup>7</sup>:

- 1) the strongest norms make a practice obligatory
- 2) strong norms make a practice appropriate
- 3) weak norms make a practice acceptable
- 4) the weakest norms make a practice possible

The strengths of the norms identified will be indicated in the report. This review found a range of social norms that impact upon corruption and S&J which can be crudely categorised as follows:

Social Norms and Corruption

- 1) Norms influencing corrupt conduct of government officials
- 2) Indirect social norms upholding corrupt behaviours
- 3) Social norms concerning gender and corruption

#### Social Norms and S&J

- 1) Social norms within the formal S&J system
- 2) Social norms within the informal S&J system

#### Social Norms and Corruption

<u>Key</u>

Social norm (Countries where norm was identified) – italics
Normative strength:

- Obligatory
- Appropriate
- Acceptable -
- Possible •

#### 1. Norms influencing the conduct of government officials

a. It is appropriate for government officials to demand bribes (DRC, CAR, Nigeria, and Afghanistan) ■

The literature review identified a social norm that it is appropriate for government officials to demand bribes as a widely extended form of petty-corruption in the DRC,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Four Avenues of Normative Influence: A Research Agsenda for Health Promotion in Low and Mid-Income Countries. Health Psychol. 2018; 37(6), 562–573.'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> 'Cislaghi B, Mackie G, Nkwi P, Shakya H. Social Norms and Child Marriage in Cameroon: An Application of the Theory of Normative Spectrum. Glob. Public Health. 2019; 14(10), 1479-1494.'

the CAR, Nigeria, and Afghanistan<sup>8</sup>. Interviews and FGDs suggest that government officials in DRC, CAR and Nigeria tend to think that others demand bribes, as well as to believe that they are themselves expected to demand bribes. A study in the CAR<sup>9</sup> based on interviews and FGDs with citizens, government officials and key informants identified how within the internal security forces in Bangui, police and the gendarmerie are perceived to act as contractors, offering a service when demanding illicit "fees" for a service. In Afghanistan<sup>10</sup>, citizens believe that government officials demand bribes because of their low salaries or the need to increase the speed of S&J service delivery. However, evidence suggests that increasing salaries without complementary measures has been an ineffective measure to reduce corruption<sup>11</sup>.

# b. It is acceptable for government officials to not demand bribes and to resist corruption (DRC) ■

Contrasting with the social norm finding that it is appropriate for government officials to demand bribes, a coexisting norm that it is acceptable for government officials to refuse to demand bribes and resist corruption was also identified. For instance, an intervention within the Criminal Justice System (CJS) in Lubumbashi (DRC)<sup>12</sup> identified government officials who had been resisting corruption on their own and supported the creation of an anti-corruption network. The motivations towards resisting corruption were explored through interviews and FGDs with 36 CJS members (female and male). Thirty two percent cited personal convictions, 27% cited religious beliefs (Christianity), and 41% cited family upbringing. Furthermore, the study suggested that CJS members were not threatened by social sanctions for non-compliance with corrupt behavior, other than minor teasing and mocking by coworkers.

# c. According to Islam, it is inappropriate to demand or pay bribes or to engage in corruption (Afghanistan) ■

The literature review found a religious norm that it is unacceptable for citizens to pay bribes according to Islam. One study in Afghanistan identified that Islam was the most common argument, cited by both female and male citizens, to discourage others from paying bribes: "Don't pay a bribe, because the bribe is forbidden in Islam and you will collect sins for yourself" 13. Citizens also highlighted how 'real' Muslims

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Aude Le Goff, Liliane Bitong, and Hélène Morvan, 'Rapport Final. Revue Transitionnelle Du Programme Kuleta Haki', *Transition International CDA Collaborative Learning Projects*, 2017

<sup>&</sup>lt;https://sites.tufts.edu/ihs/files/2020/07/Rapport-Final-Revue-Transitionnelle-du-Programme-Kuleta-Haki.pdf>; Cheyanne Scharbatke-Church, Kiely Barnard-Webster, and others, "Justice Without Corruption, It's Possible – I'm Committed". Final Evaluation Report', CDA Collaborative Learning Projects, RCN Justice & Démocratie, 2017 <a href="https://www.cdacollaborative.org/publication/justice-without-corruption-possible-im-committed/">https://www.cdacollaborative.org/publication/justice-without-corruption-possible-im-committed/</a>; Cheyanne Scharbatke-Church, Ladislas de Coster, and others, "Pity the Man Who Is Alone": Corruption in the Criminal Justice System in Bangui, Central African Republic.', CDA Collaborative Learning Projects (Cambridge, MA, 2017)

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="https://www.researchgate.net/publication/320908664\_Pity\_the\_man\_who\_is\_alone">https://www.researchgate.net/publication/320908664\_Pity\_the\_man\_who\_is\_alone</a>; Leena Koni Hoffmann, Raj Patel Candidate, and Paul Arkwright, 'Collective Action on Corruption in Nigeria: A Social Norms Approach to Connecting Society and Institutions', Chatham House, 2017

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="https://www.chathamhouse.org/sites/default/files/publications/research/2017-05-17-corruption-nigeria-hoffmann-patel-final.pdf">hoffmann-patel-final.pdf</a>; MAGENTA, 'Behavioural Research Report: Anticorruption Project Implementation Plan', *TAPPI Journal*, 2019, p. 80 <a href="https://doi.org/10.32964/tj18.3">https://doi.org/10.32964/tj18.3</a>; MAGENTA, 'The Afghan Experience of Corruption: A Citizen Journey Mapping Research Report', 2019 <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ajodo.2018.11.007">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ajodo.2018.11.007</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> MAGENTA, 'The Afghan Experience of Corruption: A Citizen Journey Mapping Research Report'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Jackson and Köbis; Scharbatke-Church and Chigas.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Scharbatke-Church, Barnard-Webster, and others.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> MAGENTA, 'Behavioural Research Report: Anticorruption Project Implementation Plan'.

do not get involved in corruption: "They are very bad people and they are not Muslim, it causes more problems to the society" <sup>14</sup>. Curiously, in the same study, Islam was not cited by citizens as an argument to encourage others to report corruption. Likewise, this same study in Afghanistan also interviewed 24 public servants who overwhelmingly reported that corruption (including bribery) is a crime which is not aligned with Islam. Some public servants stated how bribe seekers can be stigmatized within their communities.

d. It is more appropriate for healthcare workers to ask for payments than for law enforcement officials to demand bribes or extort money (Nigeria) ■

A qualitative study in Nigeria involving 21 healthcare workers identified up to 49 different corrupt practices in the health sector, including bribery and extortion<sup>15</sup>. A different study in Nigeria<sup>16</sup> analysed bribery in the health sector through a social norms perspective based on a 4,200 household survey covering seven states. Very few respondents considered that it was wrong for public healthcare workers to ask for a payment (for a service that should be free of charge), while most respondents did not consider that a law enforcement official should demand a bribe or extort money. The study argues how this difference could be explained by the fact that often users are unsure about whether they have been extorted or these payments were legitimate when it comes to health services<sup>9</sup>.

e. It is appropriate to recruit and promote government officials based on personal connections (DRC, CAR, Nigeria)

Several studies included in this review suggest that there is an extended model of recruitment and promotion based on nepotism/favouritism within the public sector in the DRC, CAR and Nigeria<sup>17</sup>. Social connections determine who is hired and promoted, also determining expectations of favours to be returned in the future. Therefore nepotism is not always socially perceived as corruption<sup>18</sup>. Social sanctions also exist for non-compliance. Studies in the CAR and Nigeria identified that refusal by government officials to use their positions to help others from their circle usually results in isolation and reprisals<sup>19</sup>.

f. It is appropriate for government officials in CAR to demand more money from Muslims (CAR) ■

This review found a social norm that it is appropriate for government officials in CAR to demand more money from Muslim citizens according to one study in Bangui's Criminal Justice System (CJS) in the CAR<sup>20</sup>. Groups with less representation within the CJS can be perceived as a more lucrative target of extortion by government officials. In Bangui, there are very few Muslim officials within the CJS. Given the importance of connections and networks, Muslims are more likely to be extorted, and

<sup>15</sup> Obinna Onwujekwe and others, 'Where Do We Start? Building Consensus on Drivers of Health Sector Corruption in Nigeria and Ways to Address It', *International Journal of Health Policy and Management*, 9.7 (2020), 286–96 <a href="https://doi.org/10.15171/ijhpm.2019.128">https://doi.org/10.15171/ijhpm.2019.128</a>.

<sup>14</sup> Ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Jackson and Köbis; Goff, Bitong, and Morvan; Scharbatke-Church, Barnard-Webster, and others; Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others; Scharbatke-Church and Chigas.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Jackson and Köbis; Goff, Bitong, and Morvan; Scharbatke-Church, Barnard-Webster, and others; Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others; Scharbatke-Church and Chigas.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others; Koni Hoffmann, Patel Candidate, and Arkwright.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others.

less likely to benefit from nepotism. Moreover, CJS officials are aware that the Muslim community will gather and contribute to payments to get their relatives out of prison.

g. It is inappropriate to pronounce guilt on people of high standing in the society (Nigeria) ■

A review about social norms and corruption in Nigeria stresses how there is a common tendency to bend the rules because of the status of people involved in a case of corruption<sup>21</sup>. Moreover, criminal charges are seldom brought up against corrupt politicians who belong to the ruling party, since the party cannot be seen to be persecuting its members. Those who try to condemn these public officers are socially sanctioned as envious.

#### 2. Indirect social norms that uphold corrupt behaviour

a. It is obligatory to ensure your extended family's survival (DRC, CAR, Nigeria)

This literature review identified a deeply rooted social norm in the DRC, the CAR and Nigeria, which is the obligation of providing for your kin (relatives, extended family, clan, tribe, religious group, etc.)<sup>22</sup> In this sense, public office is perceived as a platform for enrichment to be able to provide for your extended family, since public officials are perceived as having access to lucrative opportunities<sup>23</sup>. This social norm is captured by the Nigerian proverb: "One, whose father is in heaven, cannot be destined for hell", meaning that when one is occupying a privileged position in government, his relatives and friends should not suffer any material deprivation<sup>24</sup>. According to a review about Nigeria, it is considered moral if state resources are used to the benefit the community, but immoral if the same resources are used for individual enrichment<sup>25</sup>. Public recognition and social status is obtained when engaging in corruption to provide for your kin: "The more people you help (in your community), the more influential you are and respectable", while the opposite is socially sanctioned<sup>26</sup>.

#### b. It is appropriate to reciprocate favours (DRC, CAR, Nigeria)

Studies included in this review from the DRC<sup>27</sup>, the CAR<sup>28</sup>, Nigeria<sup>29</sup> found the social norm that it is appropriate to reciprocate favours. Studies within the Criminal Justice Systems in the DRC and CAR point out how social safety nets are built around favours between relatives and connections. An overview about social norms and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Fredrick O Onyia, 'Nepotism, Cronyism and Prebendalism: An Exploration of the Mores That Reinforce Corruption in Nigeria's Political System.', *Global Journal of Political Science and Administration*, 8.3 (2020), 1–13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Goff, Bitong, and Morvan; Scharbatke-Church, Barnard-Webster, and others; Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others; Koni Hoffmann, Patel Candidate, and Arkwright.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Goff, Bitong, and Morvan; Scharbatke-Church, Barnard-Webster, and others; Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others; Koni Hoffmann, Patel Candidate, and Arkwright.
<sup>24</sup> Onvia

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Maria Martini, 'Nigeria: Evidence of Corruption and the Influence of Social Norms', *U4 Anti-Corruption Resource Centre*, 2014, p. 12

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="https://www.transparency.org/files/content/corruptionqas/Nigeria\_overview\_of\_corruption\_and\_influence\_of\_social\_norms\_2014.pdf">https://www.transparency.org/files/content/corruptionqas/Nigeria\_overview\_of\_corruption\_and\_influence\_of\_social\_norms\_2014.pdf</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Koni Hoffmann, Patel Candidate, and Arkwright.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Goff, Bitong, and Morvan; Scharbatke-Church, Barnard-Webster, and others.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Koni Hoffmann, Patel Candidate, and Arkwright.

corruption in Nigeria acknowledged how the awarding of personal favours, such as public jobs, contracts and licenses, is a way to maintain power and constitutes a pattern of systematic clientelism<sup>30</sup>. The lack of awareness about how the use of favours may constitute a form of corruption is widespread.

#### c. It is appropriate to offer gifts as a sign of respect (DRC, CAR, Nigeria)

This literature review identified found a social norm that gifts are interpreted as sign of respect and appreciation, and are thus not always perceived as corruption. This social norm has been identified in studies in the DRC<sup>31</sup>, the CAR<sup>32</sup>, Nigeria<sup>33</sup>. Gifts often imply the expectation of receiving assistance back in the future, encouraging practices such as bribery. The person who offers the bribe would expect the recipient to return a favour in the future. A survey in Nigeria about bribery during traffic violation checks indicated that more than 90% of interviewees in Enugu State believed that asking for a bribe was wrong and illegal, while 50% believed their peers would think that agents should demand bribes. This could be an example of pluralistic ignorance, or citizens being mistaken about beliefs of other members of their community (although responses could be subject to social desirability bias). In this case, it seems the majority of people do not want to give bribes (gifts) to public officials and only do so because of the perception that everyone else does it and their belief that they are expected to do so.

#### 3. Social norms concerning gender and corruption

a. It is less appropriate for a woman to engage in corruption than it is for a man (CAR, Nigeria) ■

According to a national survey of 4,200 people carried out in Nigeria<sup>34</sup>, 59% of respondents believe it is very unlikely for a female government officials to take public funds for personal use, while 41% believe that male officials would be unlikely to do so. Findings from this survey suggest that moral judgements towards corrupt women are harsher than towards men, with a stereotype that women are more nurturing by nature, and the lack of financial responsibilities attached to them as head of the household, who is usually a man. Findings from interviews and FGDs with officials from the CJS in the CAR<sup>35</sup> also found perceptions on how women are less likely to engage in corrupt behaviour than men.

b. It is acceptable for government officials to ask for sexual favours from a woman (DRC, CAR, Nigeria, Afghanistan) ■

<sup>30</sup> Martini

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Goff, Bitong, and Morvan; Scharbatke-Church, Barnard-Webster, and others.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Koni Hoffmann, Patel Candidate, and Arkwright.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Koni Hoffmann, Patel Candidate, and Arkwright.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others.

The literature review identified a social norm that it is acceptable for government officials to ask for sexual favours from women in the DRC<sup>36</sup>, the CAR<sup>37</sup>, Nigeria<sup>38</sup>, and Afghanistan<sup>39</sup>. In a study in the CAR among criminal justice actors and citizens, women considered sexual favours to be the second-most practiced form of corruption. On the other hand, men considered that favouritism is more extended than sextortion.

#### Social Norms and S&J

#### 1. Norms concerning the formal S&J system

a. It is inappropriate to seek formal S&J providers because it is associated with shame and dishonour (Afghanistan) ■

One qualitative study in Afghanistan<sup>40</sup> based on interviews and FGDs with male and female citizens, identified how social and cultural norms persist against discussing internal community or family disputes with external actors or observers, limiting the access to external S&J providers. There is a strong taboo against taking problems outside the family or the community, and the severity of disputes should be hidden or diminished from external scrutiny. Even when individuals do seek formal S&J mechanisms for support, they often request that their use is kept secret. Going to the state or external S&J actors demonstrates that a community and its leaders are incapable of resolving issues and protecting their population. Openness to state and external S&J actors varies across regions and communities, and even some rural communities can be more open than other urban ones<sup>15</sup>.

#### b. It is acceptable to seek formal S&J providers (Afghanistan)

Contrasting with the social norm finding about shame and dishonour when seeking external S&J actors, the same study in Afghanistan<sup>41</sup> identified some communities where both men and women are relatively free to approach NGOs and external S&J actors, although women faced greater stigma. In all communities included in the study, women already knew and used NGOs offering advice on women's options for accessing the formal S&J system. Other studies in Afghanistan interviewing male and female citizens about their experiences accessing S&J services further show this norm<sup>42</sup>.

c. It is acceptable for statutory courts to function without the presence of lawyers (South Sudan)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Goff, Bitong, and Morvan; Scharbatke-Church, Barnard-Webster, and others.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Koni Hoffmann, Patel Candidate, and Arkwright.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> MAGENTA, 'The Afghan Experience of Corruption: A Citizen Journey Mapping Research Report'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Tim Luccaro and Erica Gaston, 'Women's Access to Justice in Afghanistan', *United States Institute of Peace*, 2014.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Luccaro and Gaston.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Luccaro and Gaston; MAGENTA, 'The Afghan Experience of Corruption: A Citizen Journey Mapping Research Report'; MAGENTA, 'Behavioural Research Report: Anticorruption Project Implementation Plan'.

In a study in South Sudan, based on the researchers' observation and perspectives, a social norm was found that statutory court decisions generally depend on the interpretations of a single judge, since lawyers are rarely present. 43

# d. It is inappropriate for a woman to seek formal S&J services without a man (Afghanistan) ■

A finding of the literature review from three studies about Afghanistan<sup>44</sup> is that it is inappropriate for a woman to seek formal S&J services without a man accompanying them. This pattern is upheld by indirect gender and religious norms in Afghanistan, whereby women are perceived as needing a male relative to accompany them, for either practical reasons (illiteracy) and/or social reasons (it is inappropriate for women to be in public unescorted)<sup>45</sup>. Moreover, one of these studies<sup>46</sup> identified how women commonly do not have an official government identification card (*tazkeras*), or an official marriage certificate from the state, which are necessary to establish legal protections. This documentation is particularly necessary in cases involving inheritance, marriage rights, custody, and lack of child support by fathers in cases of divorce (to obtain her *mahr*, a woman's financial rights guaranteed through her marriage contract).

#### e. It is acceptable for women to seek S&J services without a man (Afghanistan)

In contrast, another study in Afghanistan (Herat and Kabul) mapping citizens' experiences around corruption when accessing public services, including S&J, identified that it is acceptable for women to seek S&J services without a man<sup>47</sup>. However, while women reported being sexually harassed, both men and women agreed that public servants treat women better than men and do not ask them for bribes as often (women might not have money)<sup>48</sup>.

#### f. It is inappropriate for women to take active roles in security and policing (Yemen)

One study suggested a social norm that it is inappropriate for women to take active roles in security and policing in the governorate of Ta'iz in Yemen<sup>49</sup>. This social norm was identified through interviews with male and female citizens in Ta'iz and FGDs with women activists and women at a community level in the governorate.

#### q. It is acceptable for women to take active roles in security and policing (Yemen)

Contrasting with the social norm finding about it being inappropriate for women to take active roles in security and policing, the same study in Yemen<sup>50</sup> identified two other

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Rachel Ibreck, Hannah Logan, and Naomi Pendle, 'Negotiating Justice: Courts as Local Civil Authority during the Conflict in South Sudan'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Luccaro and Gaston; MAGENTA, 'The Afghan Experience of Corruption: A Citizen Journey Mapping Research Report'; MAGENTA, 'Behavioural Research Report: Anticorruption Project Implementation Plan'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> MAGENTA, 'The Afghan Experience of Corruption: A Citizen Journey Mapping Research Report'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> MAGENTA, 'The Afghan Experience of Corruption: A Citizen Journey Mapping Research Report'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> MAGENTA, 'The Afghan Experience of Corruption: A Citizen Journey Mapping Research Report'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Marie-Christine Heinze and Sophie Stevens, 'Women As Peacebuilders in Yemen', 2018, pp. 1–58 <a href="http://www.yemenpolling.org/advocacy/upfiles/YPCPublications\_Executive-Summary-and-Key-Findings-%93Women-as-Peacebulider-in-Yemen%94-June-2018.pdf">http://www.yemenpolling.org/advocacy/upfiles/YPCPublications\_Executive-Summary-and-Key-Findings-%93Women-as-Peacebulider-in-Yemen%94-June-2018.pdf</a>.
<sup>50</sup> Ibid.

governorates (Lahij and Ma'rib) where it was more acceptable for women to take active roles in security and policing. However, acceptability varies across districts within the two governorates which could be related to the intensity of the conflict, according to the researchers. For example, within in Al-Maqatira district, one of the most intense battlefields in Yemen with a heavy presence of armed groups, women are not involved in providing security. Meanwhile, in al-Hawta district where pro-government forces are in control, male and female informants agreed that many women had joined the security service either as policewomen, security guards at public facilities, or were involved in sharing intelligence services.

#### 2. Norms within customary or traditional justice systems

a. It is appropriate to violate women's rights in customary courts and traditional dispute resolution (Afghanistan, South Sudan) ■

One study in Afghanistan<sup>51</sup> identified a common custom known as *baad*, where one family gives a family member (typically girls) over to another family as a compensation for murder or violence, or to settle small debts. *Baad* is a common practice to prevent blood quarrels and to restore harmony between two communities, despite being a strong violation of girls' rights. A study in South Sudan<sup>52</sup> based on observation found how customary courts tend to impose corporal punishments on women in cases of adultery or unagreed child custody. When women bring cases of divorce or GBV, even when court panels may show sympathy for the woman's situation, their primary consideration in decision-making is the perspective of the relatives that 'own' the woman. Divorces are not commonly granted without the consent of the family and repayment of bride wealth. Even if members of court are women, they are hardly consulted in cases concerning issues involving sex or pregnancy.

b. It is acceptable for people attending hearings to contribute to their deliberations (South Sudan) ■

A study in South Sudan<sup>53</sup> stated how customary court hearings are generally held in the open, and people contribute to their deliberations. This publicity increases local accountability, but it also makes decisions susceptible to popular sentiment and prevailing local power hierarchies.

c. It is acceptable for customary courts to deal with cases involving members of the formal S&J system (South Sudan) ■

Although powerful actors within the S&J system may evade justice, people still bring cases to customary courts in the hope that they will succeed. A study in South Sudan<sup>54</sup> based on the researcher's observations, identified two examples of accountability. One case involved a customary court ruling that a soldier must pay his debt to a female seller, with the approval of community members who were watching. The other case involved a customary court requesting statements and witnesses, and disapproving of the police's practice of stealing cattle from a thief as a form of punishment.

#### 3. Social norms interventions

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Luccaro and Gaston.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Ibreck, Logan, and Pendle.

<sup>53</sup> Ibid.

<sup>54</sup> Ibid.

The aim of this section of the literature review is to identify and analyse interventions in FCAS that use a social norms approach in the areas of corruption and S&J or broader service delivery (e.g. health, gender). Social norms interventions can be understood as activities that seek to disarm or dismantle problematic social norms, or increase the visibility or influence of positive norms. Given that social norms interventions are a relatively new area of work, the majority of the papers reviewed are in fact studies or surveys that focus on a discussion about the underlying social norms that influence corruption and S&J. The methodology and search strategy used to identify papers for inclusion in this review can be found in Appendix 1.

#### A. Social Norms interventions tackling corruption

#### **Overview**

The literature review identified five papers related to social norms and corruption that fulfilled the criteria of inclusion in this review. Only one of them can be considered as an intervention that has actually implemented and which evaluated specific activities and actions to increase the visibility and influence of anti-corruption social norms within the Criminal Justice System (CJS) in the DRC. The remaining four studies aimed to analyse the influence of social norms on corruption within the formal S&J systems among government officials and citizens: one study in the CAR, one in Nigeria, and two in Afghanistan. The study in Nigeria also included a component focusing on social norms and corruption within the public healthcare system. It should be noted that these studies are part of larger multi-year anti-corruption programmes which are still at initial stages. Therefore, most of these studies consist of in-depth qualitative or mixed-methods analysis of the social norms driving corruption and how these relate to other drivers and enabling factors of corruption. A summary, main findings and recommendations of each study can be found below. An overarching assessment of the body of evidence can be found in Table 2 and an overview of the key details of these studies can be found in Appendix 3

Summary, main findings and recommendations of interventions:

# 1. Kuleta Haki Project. "Justice Without Corruption, It's Possible - I'm Committed". Final Evaluation Report<sup>55</sup>

Location: Lumbashi, Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC) (2017)

Organisation: CDA Collaborative Learning Projects

Funding: The United States Department of State Bureau of International Narcotics and

Law Enforcement Affairs (INL)

This is the only intervention that implemented specific activities and actions to strengthen previously identified positive anti-corruption social norms and attempted to shift harmful norms upholding corruption. This is a pilot intervention that established and strengthened a Network called "Kuleta Haki" within the Criminal Justice System (CJS) in Lumbashi (DRC), formed by previously identified CJS officials who were already resisting corruption on their own. The intervention's theory change was evaluated through a mixed-methods approach consisting of data collection through 40 semi-structured interviews, 2 FGDs and a questionnaire with members of the network. About 40% of interviewees reported that the intervention had increased their awareness about the negative implications of corruption in S&J, and some linked the Network to the motivation and confidence to continue to resist corruption. All members agreed that the Network should be extended, given more visibility, and aimed at tackling corruption within higher hierarchies. T-Shirts with the network's slogan "Justice without corruption, it's possible -

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Goff, Bitong, and Morvan; Scharbatke-Church, Barnard-Webster, and others.

I'm committed" reinforced pride of members and awakened interest of colleagues. The evaluation concluded that positive changes could not be fully attributed to the intervention and concerns were raised about why the network was not expanding on its own as previously expected. The inputs from the evaluation intend to improve the intervention's theory of change. This intervention is part of the Central Africa Accountable Service Delivery Initiative (CAASDI), funded by the INL.

Main findings and recommendations: Identifying and empowering anti-corruption trendsetters has the potential to reinforce positive norms against corruption and could be expected to shift harmful social norms upholding corruption among trendsetters colleagues within formal S&J systems.

# 2. "Pity the man who is alone": Corruption in the criminal justice system in Bangui, Central African Republic<sup>56</sup>

Location: Bangui, Central African Republic (CAR) (2017)

Organisation: CDA Collaborative Learning Projects

Funding: The United States Department of State Bureau of International Narcotics and

Law Enforcement Affairs (INL).

This study does not implement activities or actions for social norms change. This study intends to explore how corruption functions within the CJS in Bangui (CAR) by piloting a systems-based corruption analysis methodology tailored to FCAS based on qualitative methods. A total of 115 in-depth KIIs (39 women, 76 men), and 3 FGDs with criminal justice actors, citizens and representatives of the donor community were carried out in Bangui, CAR, in July 2017. The study produced a causal loop diagram, or systems map, elucidating how multiple factors in this particular context (including social norms) interact to drive or enable patterns of corrupt behaviour in the police, courts and correction. The project's donor unexpectedly cancelled the last phase of this intervention which was intended to recommend anti-corruption programming options for criminal justice reforms.

**Main findings and recommendations:** Researchers recommended identifying "bright spots" or factors that could be expanded to generate positive changes in social norms. For instance, the study identified how certain civil servants were operating with integrity, and how these civil servants are positively identified by co-workers. A context-specific systematic approach is recommended to tackle corruption and existing programming must identify ways to prevent exacerbating corruption in the CJS.

# 3. Collective Action on Corruption in Nigeria: A Social Norms Approach to Connecting Society and Institutions<sup>57</sup>.

Location: Nigeria (Adamawa, Benue, Enugu, Lagos, Rivers, Sokoto) (2017)

Organisation: The Chatham House and the University of Pennsylvania's Social Norms

Group (PennSONG)

Funding: UK Department for International Development (DFID)

This study does not review any activities implemented to support social norms change. It is part of the Social Norms and Accountable Governance Project (SNAG) from the Chatham House. It explores social norms and other motivations that influence everyday situations in Nigeria in which bribery, extortion, embezzlement and nepotism tend to occur. The methodology consists of a nationwide 4,200 household survey to determine whether social norms drive or hinder corrupt behaviour in Nigeria, conducted in urban and rural areas in seven different jurisdictions. Survey questions covered traffic

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others.

violations, access to public health facilities, gender norms, and local vs. national social contract.

Main findings and recommendations: Findings indicate how social norms exist in soliciting bribes but not in giving them; bribes and extortion in the health sector are considered less objectionable than those from enforcement agents at traffic checkpoints: people think women are less prone to corruption than men; and a local social contract upholds embezzlement and nepotism. Recommendations for programming include identifying trendsetters that could influence positive collective behavior change, and establishing an inter-agency unit operating across Nigeria's anti-corruption agencies which could receive training and guidance in behavioural methods for systematically evaluating interventions through randomised controlled trials to test what works best across the country.

#### 4. Behavioural Research Report: Anticorruption Project Implementation Plan<sup>58</sup>

Location: Kabul and Herat (Afghanistan) (2019)

Organisation: MAGENTA

Funding: United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)

This study does not review any activities implemented to support social norms change. It is part of UNDP's Project Initiation Plan (PIP), an instrument to initiate programmatic engagement while developing a multi-year Anti-Corruption Project in Afghanistan. The study aimed to identify and analyse contextual factors (including social norms) in Afghanistan that encourage or discourage citizens to refuse to pay bribes or to report corruption or that influence bribe seeking among public servants. The methodology included 24 interviews with public servants, 96 interviews with citizens, and a quantitative barrier analysis survey comparing citizen 'doers' with 'non-doers' of the mentioned behaviors.

Main findings: Results show that both citizens and public servants condemn corruption but at the same time consider it is necessary to access public services or to access them faster. Strong religious norms were identified against seeking and paying bribes according to Islam, while not reporting corruption is perceived as a passive action and is more widely accepted. The study does not include recommendations for programming.

#### 5. The Afghan Experience of Corruption: A citizen journey mapping research report<sup>59</sup>

Location: Kabul and Herat (Afghanistan) (2019)

Organisation: MAGENTA

Funding: United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)

This study does not review any activities implemented to support social norms change. It is part of UNDP's Project Initiation Plan (PIP) for a multi-year anti-corruption project in Afghanistan. This study piloted a citizen journey mapping methodology to gain insights about citizens' experiences around corruption when accessing public services in the S&J sectors. The formal procedures of six services were mapped in detail through KIIs with government officials: obtaining a national ID card, a driver's license, and a passport in the Ministry of Interior; obtaining a marriage certificate or a land deed at the courts; and filing a complaint and receiving a judgement at the Ministry of Justice. A total of 24 FGDs were carried out in Kabul and Herat with citizens (men and women) to explore their experiences and reactions to corruption.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Koni Hoffmann, Patel Candidate, and Arkwright.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> MAGENTA, 'Behavioural Research Report: Anticorruption Project Implementation Plan'.

**Main findings:** There is a normative expectation that Afghan citizens will pay bribes (citizens believe that others will expect them to pay). Citizens consider that bribery is unavoidable to complete and speed up government services, it is a widespread and accepted practice with rarely any social sanctions across the six services in both provinces. While women reported harassment, both men and women agreed that men were more often asked for bribes and that women were treated better. The study does not include recommendations for programming.

Table 2. Interventions tackling corruption through a social norms approach: overall assessment of body of evidence

Category of intervention	Strength of evidence	Assessment of evidence strength	Examples from
Social norms interventions that seek to tackle corruption of formal frontline law enforcement officers e.g. state police	Limited	One high quality study implemented a systems-based corruption analysis methodology tailored to FCAS in the CAR <sup>60</sup> , through sound qualitative data collection tools triangulating different sources of evidence, which had been previously piloted in the DRC and Uganda. Another study implemented a national household survey in 7 states in Nigeria, however quality is considered low since significance values for the data were not reported <sup>61</sup> . Both studies reported similar findings about social norms related to corruption in different contexts, suggesting certain degree of consistency.	CAR (Bangui)  Nigeria (Adamawa, Benue, Enugu, Lagos, Rivers, Sokoto)
Social norms interventions that seek to tackle corruption among informal frontline law enforcement officers, e.g. militia	None		
Social norms interventions that seek to tackle corruption among State judicial actors	Limited	High quality of two qualitative studies, one in the CJS in the CAR <sup>62</sup> and another in Afghanistan based on interviews and FGDs with triangulation of different	DRC (Lumbashi) CAR (Bangui)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others.

13

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Koni Hoffmann, Patel Candidate, and Arkwright.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others.

		sources of evidence. Low quality of two mixed-methods studies which do not display significance values for quantitative data in the DRC <sup>63</sup> and Afghanistan. All studies reported similar findings about social norms related to corruption in different countries and contexts, suggesting certain degree consistency.	Afghanistan (Kabul, Herat)
Social norms	None		
interventions that seek to			
tackle corruption of non- state judicial actors			
e.g. religious			
leaders/traditional			
elders			
Social norms	None		
interventions that seek to			
tackle corruption among			
political elites and/or			
citizens			

#### B. Social norms interventions in Security & Justice (S&J)

#### **Overview**

The review identified seven papers related to social norms that fulfilled the inclusion criteria for this review. Four are related to social norms interventions tackling violence against women and girls (VAWG), violence against children (VAC) and/or gender-based violence (GBV) in Afghanistan, South Sudan, Nigeria and Yemen. Another paper provides very limited information about a set of S&J interventions engaging youth which mention social norms components in different FCAS settings (Burundi, CAR, Libya and the Occupied Palestinian Territories). Finally, two papers are qualitative studies which describe existing social norms related to women's access to justice in Afghanistan and the participation of women in peacebuilding in Yemen. A summary, main findings and recommendations of each intervention or study can be found below, followed by an overarching assessment of the body of evidence in Table 3. An overview of the key details of these papers can be found in Appendix 3

Summary, main findings and recommendations of interventions:

Social norms interventions tackling VAWG, VAC and/or GBV

1. What works to prevent violence against children in Afghanistan? Findings of an interrupted time series evaluation of a school-based peace education and community social norms change intervention in Afghanistan<sup>64</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Goff, Bitong, and Morvan; Scharbatke-Church, Barnard-Webster, and others.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Julienne Corboz and others, 'What Works to Prevent Violence against Children in Afghanistan? Findings of an Interrupted Time Series Evaluation of a School-Based Peace Education and Community Social

Location: Jawzjan province, Afghanistan (2016-2017) Organisation: Help the African Children (HTAC)

Funding: UK Department for International Development (DFID)

Corboz et al. evaluated the impact of HTAC's Peace Education two-year school and community-based intervention which intended to change harmful social norms and practices related to gender and the use of violence in conflict resolution in Afghanistan in order to prevent violence against children (VAC). The intervention included peace education classes outside school hours for 3.500 children with 50 trained teachers: the establishment of 10 peace committees with members of existing community shuras (councils); capacity building of 2,000 female representatives of civil society organisations and government officials; conflict resolution and peace building training for parents and community leaders; radio-messaging programme about VAWG and VAC. The crosssectional evaluation involved data collection through questionnaire interviews with 720 children (50% boys and 50% girls) and observed a self-reported significant decrease both in peer violence and corporal punishment against children at the school level, and VAWG at the wider community level. However, there was no control group, no data triangulation with other programme beneficiaries (parents, female representatives or shura members). The researchers acknowledged it was not possible to identify which components of the intervention contributed to its positive impact in reduction of VAWG and VAC, or 'what worked' in social norms change.

# 2. Voices for Change programme (V4C). Attitudes, practices and social norms survey: Endline Report<sup>65</sup>

Location: Nigeria (Enugu, Kaduna, Kano and Lagos States) (2013-2017) Organisation: UK Department for International Development (DFID)

Funding: DFID

The impact of the Voices for Change programme (V4C) on attitudes and behaviours in Nigeria was assessed through the Attitudes, Practices and Social Norms (APSN) mixed-methods survey. The ASPN survey consists of 250 questions and was conducted four times over the five-year lifetime of the programme among a representative sample of 4,799 young people aged 16-25 in four target states. V4C focused on support of women in leadership positions, acceptance of women's role in decision-making and preventing VAWG. The main actions consisted in a branded mass media campaign, facilitated group dialogues, and advocacy for gender equality legislation. The APSN endline results show large-scale changes in young people's gender attitudes and behaviours and how exposure to the intervention corresponds with greater self-reported social norms change. However, positive changes are related to the acceptance of women in decision-making and leadership positions, while V4C has had limited effect in changing young people's attitudes and behaviours towards VAWG. The study concludes that social norms related to VAWG are deeply rooted in Nigerian society, and the ASPN surveys did not show positive changes related to these norms throughout the five-year period.

# 3. Evaluating the Communities Care Program: best practice for rigorous research to evaluate gender-based violence prevention and response programs in humanitarian settings (South Sudan and Somalia)<sup>66</sup>

Location: South Sudan (Warrap State and Central Equatoria State) (2016-2017)

Norms Change Intervention in Afghanistan', *PLoS ONE* (Public Library of Science, 2019) <a href="https://journals.plos.org/plosone/article?id=10.1371/journal.pone.0220614">https://journals.plos.org/plosone/article?id=10.1371/journal.pone.0220614</a>>.

Elaine Denny and Claire Hughes, 'Attitudes, Practices and Social Norms Survey: Endline Report', 2017
 <a href="https://itad.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/11/V4C-ASPN-Endline-Report-Print-Ready-ID-179962.pdf">https://itad.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/11/V4C-ASPN-Endline-Report-Print-Ready-ID-179962.pdf</a>.
 N. Glass and others, 'Evaluating the Communities Care Program: Best Practice for Rigorous Research to Evaluate Gender Based Violence Prevention and Response Programs in Humanitarian Settings', Conflict and Health, 12.1 (2018), 1–10 <a href="https://doi.org/10.1186/s13031-018-0138-0">https://doi.org/10.1186/s13031-018-0138-0</a>.

Organisation: UNICEF / Johns Hopkins University School of Nursing

Funding: UNICEF

UNICEF's Communities Care Program aimed to transform harmful social norms that sustain GBV in conflict-affected communities in South Sudan and Somalia. Targeted communities in South Sudan were Yei County in Central Equatoria State and Gogrial West County in Warrap State. The intervention delivered 15 weeks of structured and facilitated dialogues to empower influential community members to work together to identify GBV as a problem within the community and identify norms that support gender equity, safety and wellbeing. A social norms measurement instrument<sup>67</sup> was developed to assess personal beliefs about the norms that uphold GBV, beliefs about how influential community members expect one to behave, and beliefs about how others in the community behave related to GBV. Using the social norms measure as the primary outcome, an impact evaluation of the Communities Care programme was conducted in Somalia and is still ongoing in South Sudan. The evaluation methodology consists of a longitudinal mixed-methods randomised controlled trial (RC) where 200 men and women from intervention and control groups were eligible to participate in three separate interviews at baseline, midline and endline, over a 12-month period. It has not been possible to find results from this RCT which identify 'what worked'.

#### 4. "Safe Age of Marriage" in Yemen: Fostering Change in Social Norms<sup>68</sup>

Location: Yemen (Al-Sawd and Al-Soodah districts in Amran) (2008-2009) Organisation: Extending Service Delivery (ESD) and Pathfinder International Funding: USAID

The intervention aimed to catalyse change in social norms and communities' attitudes towards early marriage, promote girls' education, and advance the girls' rights in two districts of Yemen. Male and female community educators were trained through participatory workshops where social and religious norms and practices related to child marriage were addressed. Community educators included religious leaders and nurse midwives who later facilitated debates, role-plays, storytelling, and poetry recitations in schools, health centres, mosques and at the Yemeni Women's Union. They also organised monthly health fairs with mobile clinics providing sexual and reproductive health services. Unmarried girls' perceptions were explored through 12 FGDs. The baseline survey to assess attitudes and knowledge about child marriage included 400 households. The endline survey showed a 18% increase in the understanding about the benefits of postponing marriage to adulthood. Information about this intervention is limited to USAID's summary/fact sheet about the intervention and does not specify in what way positive outcomes are attributable to the intervention or 'what worked' within the intervention. Findings are limited since it was not possible to identify reports, methodology or evaluation of these interventions.

S&J interventions involving youth with a social norms component

#### 5. Youth: Game Changers in Fragile Contexts<sup>69</sup>

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Nancy Perrin and others, 'Social Norms and Beliefs about Gender Based Violence Scale: A Measure for Use with Gender Based Violence Prevention Programs in Low-Resource and Humanitarian Settings', *Conflict and Health*, 13.1 (2019), 1–12 <a href="https://doi.org/10.1186/s13031-019-0189-x">https://doi.org/10.1186/s13031-019-0189-x</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Leah Sawalha Freij, "Safe Age of Marriage" in Yemen: Fostering Change in Social Norms', *Pathfinder International*, 2009, pp. 1–4 <a href="https://www.pathfinder.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/10/ESD-Child-Marriage.pdf">https://www.pathfinder.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/10/ESD-Child-Marriage.pdf</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> CORDAID, 'Youth: Game Changers in Fragile Contexts.', 2015 <a href="https://www.cordaid.org/en/wp-content/uploads/sites/3/2015/02/Position\_Paper\_Youth\_LR\_12032015.pdf">https://www.cordaid.org/en/wp-content/uploads/sites/3/2015/02/Position\_Paper\_Youth\_LR\_12032015.pdf</a>.

Location: Burundi (Cibitoke, Gitega, Ruygi and Bujumbura Rural), CAR (Bangui, Bozoum, Bossangoa and Kaga Bandoro), Lybia and Occupied Palestinian Territories

Organisation: CORDAID

Information about this intervention is limited to a position paper that summarises the array of projects implemented by the NGO CORDAID in FCAS aiming to engage youth in S&J as agents of change for sustainable peace. The potential of these interventions for a social norms shift is not specified in the position paper, which does not provide evidence about how these have contributed to a shift in social norms. In six communities in Burundi, one intervention focused in restoring trust between government authorities and the citizens for sustainable peace, by supporting the inclusion of youth in local security committees which mainly work with land conflicts, inheritance issues and VAWG. In four communities in the CAR, the Social Cohesion and Reconciliation programme aimed to restore trust in interpersonal relationships between and within communities. Youth were encouraged to participate in community security committees and youth platforms through community-based activities such as a forum theatre ('theatre of the oppressed'), FGD, non-violence posters and radio animation and journalism. In MENA countries, CORDAID invested in 75 young community leaders (men and women) through capacity building to develop methodologies that enable a cultural norms shift involving religious leaders.

Studies on women and S&J, including social norms

#### 6. Women's Access to Justice in Afghanistan<sup>70</sup>

Location: Afghanistan (Daykundi, Herat, Jowzjan, Kabul, Sar-e Pol provinces) (2013) Organisation: United States Institute of Peace Funding: US Agency for International Development's Office for Democracy Governance and US Department of State Bureau of International Narcotics and Law

Enforcement Affairs.

This study does not review any activities implemented to support social norms change and does not evaluate the effectiveness of an intervention. This study consists of a survey that explores social norms and practical barriers to women's access to justice in Afghanistan. Researchers carried out 107 in-depth interviews, 23 FGDs, 31 case study interviews with individual disputants, and 53 additional informal, semi-structured discussions and interviews with women and men in urban and rural communities in five different provinces in Afghanistan. Drawing on responses, the study documents how women navigate access to justice within their options via their family, community, or external mechanisms. Different types of barriers to women's access to justice are identified (normative, consequential, or practical) and the study suggests that these can only be reduced through long-term normative change. Seeking formal S&J providers is associated with shame and dishonour. Despite existing barriers for women to access S&J without a man's company, examples were identified where women successfully access S&J service unaccompanied. A strategy combining both community-based justice approach with formal state justice providers is recommended. Elder women, female members of community councils (shuras), or female teachers provide opportunities and spaces to protect women's rights within community forums. The study also recommends identifying and supporting existing community protection schemes for women, such as Pashtun traditional community-safe houses for women victims of community breaches or domestic violence.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Luccaro and Gaston.

#### 7. Women as Peacebuilders in Yemen<sup>71</sup>

Location: Yemen (Ma'rib, Ta'iz, and Lahij governorates) (2018)

Organisation: Social Development Direct (SDDirect)

Funding: UK Conflict, Security and Stability Fund (CSSF) for Yemen

This study does not evaluate the effectiveness of an intervention, but rather describes existing social norms related to women's participation in peacebuilding in three different governorates in Yemen. This is a qualitative study based on 94 in-depth, semi-structured interviews and six FGDs with different target groups: citizens (men and women), women engaged in peacebuilding, traditional and religious leaders, village council members and representatives of local government. The aim was to explore women's experiences, changes in gender norms and roles, and religious discourses during conflict and peacebuilding and differences across three different governorates. Negative changes (increase in child marriage and GBV) and positive changes (increase in women's roles as breadwinners and humanitarian agents) were identified. The latter implied additional chores and duties and negatively impacted on the relationship between men and women. It was identified that women actively participate in mediating and resolving family, community and inter-tribal conflicts in three different governorates in Yemen. In some areas women play an active role in security, as policewomen, security guards, while in other areas this was not stated or did not seem acceptable. Women in all areas described supporting fighters with food and money. This study was intended to inform UK policy and programming in support of women's engagement in conflict prevention, peace and stability activities in Yemen.

Table 3. Interventions in the areas of S&J or broader service delivery through a social norms approach: overall assessment of body of evidence

Category of intervention	Strength of evidence	Assessment of evidence strength	Examples from
Social norms interventions that seek to improve service delivery by primary S&J service providers (formal or informal) e.g. law enforcement officers/militia	None	No studies were found.	N/A
Social norms interventions that seek to enhance access to S&J services and institutions (formal or informal) and to improve service delivery by state or non-state judicial actors (e.g. state judges, traditional leaders)	None	Anecdotal information and opinions come from NGO CORDAID's position paper <sup>72</sup> about S&J interventions targeting youth and attempting to shift social norms affecting S&J at community level in different FCAS. There is no information about specific approaches, methodologies or evaluation of these interventions. Quality assessment was not possible	Occupied Palestinian Territories, Libya, DRC (Bangui, Bozoum, Bossangoa and Kaga Bandoro), and Burundi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Heinze and Stevens.

<sup>72</sup> CORDAID.

		due to lack of basic technical	
		information.	
Social norms interventions that seek to enhance access of women to S&J services and institutions (formal or informal)	Limited	Low quality studies. Qualitative methodology based on in-depth interviews and FGDs, comparing urban-rural areas and/or diverse cultural settings in both countries. One study in Afghanistan exploring women's access to S&J only includes men and women as informants <sup>73</sup> , missing opportunities to triangulate information with other key informants (religious leaders and community court members). The other study in Yemen is more comprehensive including religious leaders, etc. although available information is very limited <sup>74</sup> . Bias (selection, social desirability) are not addressed. Assessment of consistency of findings between studies was not possible due to lack of detailed methodology.	Afghanistan (provinces of Daykundi, Herat, Jowzjan, Kabul, and Sar-e Pol) Yemen (Ma'rib, Ta'iz, and Lahij)
Social norms interventions that target the prevention of S&J issues e.g. physical violence, economic violence, violation of land rights	Limited	One high quality study in Nigeria measured social norms shift in the Voices for Change (V4C) gender intervention through rigorous measurement methodology (APSN mixed-methods tool) <sup>75</sup> . The remaining three studies are of low quality. An evaluation cross-sectional survey of a social norms intervention in Afghanistan by Help the Afghan Children (HTAC) <sup>76</sup> reports impact in reduction of VAWG and VAC, although changes in norms could not determined. There was no control group and the study does not triangulate findings with other study participants (religious leaders, parents, female CSO representatives). Full quality assessment was not possible for the remaining studies, since	Afghanistan (Jawzjan)  Nigeria (Enugu, Kaduna, Kano and Lagos States)  South Sudan (Warrap State and Central Equatoria State)  Yemen (Amran)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Luccaro and Gaston.
<sup>74</sup> Heinze and Stevens.
<sup>75</sup> Denny and Hughes.
<sup>76</sup> Corboz and others.

		the final evaluation is not yet available for UNICEF's Communities Care RCT in South Sudan (despite the sound methodology), <sup>77</sup> and USAID's fact sheet is the only document that could be found for the intervention on social norms and child marriage in Yemen <sup>78</sup> . Assessment of consistency of findings between studies was not possible due to diverging focus of studies. Body of evidence limited to WAWG and VAC.	
Social norms interventions that seek to improve the professionalism/conduct of primary S&J providers.	None	No studies were found.	N/A
Social norms interventions that seek to influence service delivery more broadly (e.g. health/education)	None	No studies were found.	N/A

#### 4. Research gaps and implications for SSJP

This section of the paper identifies research gaps and recommendations in the field of social norms, corruption and S&J that may be relevant for SSJP. These include:

#### Social norms tackling corruption

Despite the limited number of social norms interventions identified in this literature review, there seems to be a consistent and increasing body of evidence with innovative research methodologies being developed in the area of social norms and corruption, in some cases tailored to FCAS. Currently, these interventions focus mainly on social norms and corruption within the formal S&J systems and among the lower hierarchies of government officials. These do not focus on social norms among informal S&J systems and do not tackle corruption among political elites or citizens more precisely. Specific resources to guide programming towards social norms approaches to anti-corruption interventions have been developed, such as "Anti-corruption through a social norms lens" (Köbis, 2018)<sup>79</sup>, "Understanding Social Norms: A Reference Guide for Policy and Practice" (Scharbatke-Church et al., 2019)<sup>80</sup> and "Reassessing donor performance in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Glass and others.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Freij.

<sup>79</sup> Jackson and Köbis.

<sup>80</sup> Scharbatke-Church and Chigas.

anti-corruption. Pathways to more effective practice"(Mason, 2021)<sup>81</sup>. The SSJP should build upon these proposed methodologies and derived lessons learnt for the development of its theory of change and further stages of the project. According to this literature review's findings, recommendations for future research and interventions regarding social norms and corruption should include the following:

- 1. Social norms interventions that seek to identify and empower trendsetters who resist corruption in their workplace within the S&J system. Initial evidence has been found in an intervention in the DRC<sup>82</sup>, where the theory of change has been evaluated and could guide the design of future interventions.
- Social norms interventions in order to gain more insights about the implications
  of gender in corruption and anti-corruption strategies. Initial evidence was
  identified through gender components within interventions in the CAR and
  Nigeria.
- 3. Social norms interventions that seek to empower minority or neglected groups (religious, minority ethnic, etc.) that can be more prone to suffer from corrupt behaviours according to each specific community and context. Limited evidence was identified among the Muslim community in the CAR, however this intervention did not address how to alleviate the issue.
- 4. Social norms interventions that explore the feasibility, role and empowerment of whistleblowers within anti-corruption strategies, and how to equip them in order to contribute to a positive norms shift within their institutions and/or communities.
- 5. Social norms interventions that seek to improve the professionalism, integrity and conduct of formal and informal S&J providers.
- 6. Social norms interventions that seek to tackle corruption of non-state judicial actors (e.g. religious leaders, traditional elders).
- 7. Social norms interventions that further explore and address perceptions and attitudes of the international donor community towards tackling corruption within S&J. Initial evidence was identified in the DRC<sup>83</sup> through interviews with representatives of the donor community, showing how donors hold strong beliefs towards not addressing corruption within their programmes since they feel that these could be undermined by attempts to tackle corruption.
- 8. Social norms interventions that tackle corruption among citizens and elites (including both in public and private sectors).

#### Social Norms and Security and Justice (S&J)

The majority of social norms interventions identified by this literature review were focused on preventing S&J issues from occurring, such as interventions focused on VAWG and VAC. However, the quality of evidence was found to be limited. Several gaps in the body of evidence were found, which represent opportunities to further explore social norms interventions that could guide future steps in the SSJP. According to this literature review's findings, recommendations for future research and interventions in the area of S&J and social norms should include the following:

1. Social norms interventions that seek to influence positive interactions between formal and informal S&J providers that enhance human rights

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> Phil Mason, 'Reassessing Donor Performance in Anti-Corruption. Pathways to More Effective Practice', *U4 Anti-Corruption Resource Centre*, 2021 <a href="https://www.u4.no/publications/reassessing-donor-performance-in-anti-corruption">https://www.u4.no/publications/reassessing-donor-performance-in-anti-corruption</a>>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> Goff, Bitong, and Morvan; Scharbatke-Church, Barnard-Webster, and others.

<sup>83</sup> Ibid.

- 2. Social norms interventions that seek to prevent S&J issues from occurring. The review found some limited evidence on social norms interventions designed to prevent VAWG and VC in Afghanistan Nigeria, South Sudan and Yemen.
- 3. Social norms interventions that seek to improve access and promote engagement of women in formal and informal S&J systems. Limited evidence has been identified in Yemen and Afghanistan.
- 4. Social norms interventions that seek to improve access and promote engagement of youth in state and non-state S&J systems. Very limited evidence was identified in Burundi, the DRC, Libya and the Occupied Palestinian Territories.
- Social norms interventions that seek to improve access and service delivery of formal and informal S&J providers by neglected minority groups such as people living with disabilities, people with albinism, or LGBT population seeking external S&J services through NGOs and CSOs, or other.
- 6. Social norms interventions that seek to improve the professionalism/conduct of primary S&J providers.
- 7. Social norms interventions involving community and religious leaders concerning dynamics across hybrid S&J systems.
- 8. Social norms interventions than can rebuild trust of citizens within state S&J systems towards the enhancement of human rights.
- 9. Interventions that seek to identify and promote positive social norms that uphold community practices which protect citizens from S&J issues enhancing human rights. Examples of such approaches in the literature include the Pashtun traditional community-safe houses for women victims of community breach or domestic violence identified in Afghanistan.

# Appendix 1: Literature review methodology, search strategy and search results

Relevant papers were obtained from a variety of sources such as peer-reviewed journal articles, conference proceedings, technical reports, policy statements, amongst others. As discussed in the limitations section, the large amount of FCAS (38 countries) together with time and human resources restrictions, a search was limited to one online database (MEDLINE). A date restriction was not applied to the search results, to maximise the number of results generated. To ensure that relevant studies were not inadvertently excluded due to use of different language, variations of each search term were used. For example, variations of the term "social norms" included "norm\*" and "behavio?r". Boolean operators "AND" and "OR" were used to cover all possible combinations of terms and truncation was used to ensure that minor variations in terms did not result in the exclusion of relevant results e.g. plural vs singular words. Likewise, adjacency proximity operator "ADJ" was applied to include the terms related to FCS. Search terms included each country's name and demonym. Searches were conducted within the title, abstract, and keyword lists of each database. Articles were initially assessed on the basis of their title and abstract in order to screen their relevance for this review. A total of 3,607 title/abstract reviews were undertaken from MEDLINE database and additional 257 from Google, Google Scholar and Scopus. Following this, full-text copies of studies for possible inclusion in the review were obtained in order to conduct a more thorough evaluation of their relevance. To search for relevant grey literature, a variety of search terms were entered into the search engine google, with several thousand search results reviewed. The references/bibliography of included studies were searched for additional relevant studies.

In determining relevant studies for this review, the following **essential** inclusion criteria were used:

- i. The research is undertaken in one of the 38 FCAS (excluding Somalia) [Studies FCAS diaspora populations were excluded from this literature review]
- ii. The full text of the research article is accessible and available in English, Portuguese or French.

One search was undertaken to cover all three components of this literature review, seeking to identify evidence from research or interventions where social norms tackle Security & Justice and/or Corruption. Search terms for the country of Somalia were excluded, since a specific literature review has been carried out for this country within the current SSJP Project.

#### **Search Strategy**

(NORM or NORMS or TRADITION\* or CLAN\* or TABOO\* or FOLKWAY or MORES or BEHAVIO?R\*)

#### AND

(ACCOUNTAB\* or RESPONSIBI\* or UNACCOUNTAB\* or LIAB\* or ANSWERAB\* or CORRUPT\* or ANTI-CORRUPT\* or BRIB\* or TRANSPAREN\* or ENFORCEAB\* or SANCTION or SANCTIONS or SECURIT\* or JUSTICE or VIOLEN\* or INSECURIT\* or FRAGIL\* or JUDICIA\* or COURT or COURTS or CONFLICT or CONFLICTS or LAW ENFORCEMENT or CUSTOMARY LAW or SHARIA or ISLAMIC LAW or LEGAL or ILLEGAL OR ILLEGALITY OR LEGALITY OR POLICE\* or LAWYER\* or PROSECUTOR\* or DEFENDANT or CIVIL WAR or PEACE\* or STABILITY OR SAFETY OR PROTECTION OR SOCIAL CONTRACT OR SOCIAL COVENANT OR INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE OR SECURITY REFORM OR TRANSITION\*)

#### AND

(AFGHAN\* or BURKINA FASO or BURKINA FASSO or BURKINAB\* or UPPER VOLTA or BURUNDI or BARUNDI or BURUNDIAN\* or CAMEROON\* or CENTRAL AFRICAN REPUBLIC or UBANGI-SHARI or CHAD or CHADIAN\* or COMOROS or COMORAN\* or COMORIAN\* or CONGO or CONGOLESE or ERITREA\* or GAMBIA\* or GUINEA-BISSAU or PORTUGUESE GUINEA or BISSAU GUINEAN\* or HAITI\* or HAYTI\* or IRAQ\* or KIRIBATI or I-KIRIBATI or GILBERT ISLANDS or PHOENIX ISLANDS or LINE ISLANDS or KOSOV\* or LAO or LAOS or LAOTIAN\* or LEBANON or LEBANESE or LIBERIA\* or LIBYA\* or MALI or MALIAN or MALINESE or MARSHALL ISLANDS or MARSHALLESE or MICRONESIA\* or MOZAMBIQUE or MOZAMBICAN\* or MYANMA\* or BURMA or BURMESE or NIGER\* or PAPUA NEW GUINEA\* or PAPUAN\* or SOLOMON ISLAND\* or SUDAN\* or SYRIA\* or TIMOR-LESTE or EAST TIMOR or TIMORESE or TUVALU or TUVALUAN\* or ELLICE ISLANDS or VENEZUELA\* or PALESTIN\* or WEST BANK or GAZA or YEMEN\* or ZIMBABWE\* or SOUTHERN RHODESIA\*)

#### OR

((FRAGILE or FRAGILITY or CONFLICT\*) adj2 (SITUATION or SITUATIONS or STATE\* or SETTING\* or COUNTRY or COUNTRIES or CONTEXT or CONTEXTS))

#### Limitations of the literature review

The findings of this literature review should be examined bearing in mind the following limitations. In terms of time and resources, only one researcher carried out this review during a short time period. Given the fact that key words for 37 countries were included in the search strategy, and that searches yielded a vast amount of results, the search strategy had to be limited to one main data base (MEDLINE). Additional focused searches were conducted in Google, Google Scholar and Scopus. Moreover, it is probable that the search terms used did not fully capture the totality of literature on this topic. Therefore, gaps in the search strategy might lead to the possibility of relevant studies not being identified by this review. The absence of a secondary reviewer meant that the selection of studies for inclusion by the primary reviewer could not be revised. In terms of the findings of this review, several considerations must be taken into account when used to inform design of future research and interventions. First, findings are derived from a small number of studies within a diverse variety of countries, where triangulation of sources of evidence has not been possible. Second, a comprehensive and systematic appraisal of each of the included studies was not possible due to the limited scope of this literature review. Therefore, findings might derive from studies with limitations that call into question their validity.

# Appendix 2: Social norms table

#### SOCIAL NORMS AND CORRUPTION

Key Social norm – italics Normative strength:

- Obligatory
- Appropriate
- Acceptable =
- Possible

Social Norm	Study	Location of finding	Normative strength	Source of finding
1. Norms influencing the conduction	ct of gov	ernment offic	ials and publi	c servants
It is appropriate for government officials to demand bribes	84	DRC, CAR, Nigeria, Afghanistan	•	In-depth interviews, KIIs, FGDs with citizens and government officials (M/F) and researcher perspective
It is acceptable for government officials to not pay bribes and to resist corruption	85	DRC	•	Interviews and FGDs with government officials (M/F) and researcher perspective
According to Islam, it is inappropriate to demand or pay bribes, or to engage in corruption	86	Afghanistan	•	Interviews with citizens (M/F) and public servants (gender not specified)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> Goff, Bitong, and Morvan; Scharbatke-Church, Barnard-Webster, and others; Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others; Koni Hoffmann, Patel Candidate, and Arkwright; MAGENTA, 'Behavioural Research Report: Anticorruption Project Implementation Plan'; MAGENTA, 'The Afghan Experience of Corruption: A Citizen Journey Mapping Research Report'; Jackson and Köbis; Scharbatke-Church and Chigas.
<sup>85</sup> Scharbatke-Church, Barnard-Webster, and others.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> MAGENTA, 'Behavioural Research Report: Anticorruption Project Implementation Plan'.

	T ==	1	ı	
It is more appropriate for healthcare workers to ask for payments than for law enforcement officials to demand	87	Nigeria	•	4,200 household survey in 7 different states
bribes or extort money				
It is appropriate to recruit and promote government officials based on personal connections	88	DRC, CAR, Nigeria,	•	In-depth interviews, KIIs, FGDs with citizens and government officials (M/F) and researcher perspective
It is appropriate for government officials to demand more money from Muslims	89	CAR (Bangui)	•	In-depth KII and FGD with CJS officials, citizens and donors (M/F)
It is inappropriate to pronounce guilt on people of high standing in the society	90	Nigeria	•	Researcher perspective
2. Indirect social norms that uph	old cor	rupt behavior		
It is obligatory to ensure your extended family's survival	91	DRC, CAR, Nigeria,	•	In-depth interviews, KIIs, FGDs with citizens and government officials (M/F) and researcher perspective
It is appropriate to reciprocate favours	92	DRC, CAR, Nigeria,	•	In-depth interviews, KIIs, FGDs with citizens and government officials (M/F) and researcher perspective
It is appropriate to offer gifts in exchange for services as a sign of respect	93	DRC, CAR, Nigeria,	•	In-depth interviews, KIIs, FGDs with citizens and government officials (M/F) and researcher perspective
3. Social norms concerning gen	der and	corruption		
It is less acceptable for a woman to engage in corruption than it is for a man	94	CAR Nigeria		In-depth interviews, KIIs, FGDs with citizens and government officials (male and female)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> Koni Hoffmann, Patel Candidate, and Arkwright.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> Goff, Bitong, and Morvan; Scharbatke-Church, Barnard-Webster, and others; Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others; Koni Hoffmann, Patel Candidate, and Arkwright.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others.

<sup>90</sup> Onyia

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Goff, Bitong, and Morvan; Scharbatke-Church, Barnard-Webster, and others; Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others; Koni Hoffmann, Patel Candidate, and Arkwright.
<sup>92</sup> Ibid.

<sup>93</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others; Koni Hoffmann, Patel Candidate, and Arkwright.

It is appropriate for government	95	DRC, CAR,	•	In-depth interviews,
officials to ask for sexual favours		Nigeria,		KIIs, FGDs with
from a woman		Afghanistan		citizens and
				government officials
				(M/F) and researcher
				perspective

#### **SOCIAL NORMS AND S&J**

1. Norms within the formal S&J	system			
It is inappropriate to seek formal S&J providers because it is associated with shame and dishonour	96	Afghanistan	•	In-depth interviews and FGDs with male and female citizens
It is acceptable to seek formal S&J providers	97	Afghanistan	•	In-depth interviews, KIIs and FGDs with citizens and government officials (men and women)
It is acceptable for statutory courts to function without the presence of lawyers	98	South Sudan	•	Researcher perspective, observation
It is inappropriate for women to seek S&J services without a man	99	Afghanistan	•	In-depth interviews and FGDs with male and female citizens
It is acceptable for women to seek S&J services without a man	100	Afghanistan	•	In-depth interviews, KIIs and FGDs with citizens and government officials (men and women)
It is inappropriate for women to take active roles in security and policing	101	Yemen	•	In-depth interviews and FGDs with citizens, female activists & religious leaders
It is acceptable for women for women to take active roles in security and policing	102	Yemen	•	In-depth interviews and FGDs with citizens, female activists & religious leaders
2. Social norms within customary/ traditional justice systems				

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> Goff, Bitong, and Morvan; Scharbatke-Church, Barnard-Webster, and others; Scharbatke-Church, Coster, and others; Koni Hoffmann, Patel Candidate, and Arkwright; Luccaro and Gaston.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> Luccaro and Gaston.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Luccaro and Gaston; MAGENTA, 'The Afghan Experience of Corruption: A Citizen Journey Mapping
 Research Report'; MAGENTA, 'Behavioural Research Report: Anticorruption Project Implementation Plan'.
 <sup>98</sup> Ibreck, Logan, and Pendle.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Luccaro and Gaston; MAGENTA, 'The Afghan Experience of Corruption: A Citizen Journey Mapping Research Report'; MAGENTA, 'Behavioural Research Report: Anticorruption Project Implementation Plan'.
 <sup>100</sup> Luccaro and Gaston; MAGENTA, 'The Afghan Experience of Corruption: A Citizen Journey Mapping Research Report'; MAGENTA, 'Behavioural Research Report: Anticorruption Project Implementation Plan'.
 <sup>101</sup> Heinze and Stevens

It is appropriate to violate women's rights in customary courts and traditional dispute resolution	103	Afghanistan	•	In-depth interviews and FGDs with male and female citizens
It is acceptable for people attending hearings in customary courts to contribute to their deliberations	104	South Sudan		Researcher perspective/ observation
It is acceptable for customary courts to deal with cases involving members from the formal S&J system	105	South Sudan	•	Researcher perspective/ observation

## **Appendix 3: Intervention key information**

Study	Basic information
ANTI-CORRUPTION	
Kuleta Haki     Project DRC <sup>6,7</sup>	Evaluation of the theory of change within the anti-corruption pilot intervention implemented in Lubumbashi, DRC. Mixed-methods

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> Luccaro and Gaston.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> Ibreck, Logan, and Pendle..

<sup>105</sup> Ibid

	evaluation with data collection through 40 semi-structured interviews, 2 FGDs and a questionnaire with members of an anti-corruption network.
2. Criminal Justice System in CAR <sup>8</sup>	Qualitative study based on 115 in-depth KII (39 women, 76 men), and 3 FGD with criminal justice actors, citizens and representatives of the donor community in Bangui, CAR. The study pilots a systems-based corruption analysis methodology tailored to FCAS.
3. Connecting Society and Institutions in Nigeria9	Study based on a national 4,200 household survey to determine whether social norms drive or hinder corrupt behaviours in Nigeria (bribery, extortion, nepotism and embezzlement), conducted in urban and rural areas in seven different jurisdictions.
Anti-corruption project in Afghanistan <sup>10</sup>	Mixed-methods study with data derived from 24 interviews with public servants, 96 interviews with citizens, and a quantitative barrier analysis survey comparing citizen 'doers' with 'non-doers' of refusal to pay bribes and to report corruption. Study undertaken in Kabul and Herat.
5. Citizen experience of Corruption in Afghanistan <sup>11</sup>	Qualitative study. Citizen journey mapping methodology of six selected services through KIIs with government officials. 24 FGD in Kabul and Herat with men and women to explore their experiences and reactions to corruption within the selected services.
SECURITY& JUSTIC	E
6. Women's Access to Justice in Afghanistan <sup>15</sup>	Qualitative study with data derived from 107 in-depth interviews, 23 FGDs, 31 case study interviews and 53 informal, semi-structured discussions and interviews with women and men in urban and rural communities in 5 provinces in Afghanistan.
7. Peace Education in Afghanistan <sup>17</sup>	Mixed-methods evaluation of a social norms intervention through questionnaire interviews with 720 children (50% boys and 50% girls) in Jawzjan province, Afghanistan.
8. Voices 4 Change in Nigeria <sup>18</sup>	Endline report of a social norms intervention (Voices for Change) through the Attitudes, Practices and Social Norms (APSN) mixed-methods survey in 4 states in Nigeria. Limited effect in changing young people's attitudes and behaviours towards VAWG.
9. Communities CARE Program in South Sudan <sup>19</sup>	Mixed-methods RCT with 200 men and women in 2 states in South Sudan, to assess impact of UNICEF's Communities Care Program through social norms measurement instrument <sup>20</sup> .
10.Youth: Game Changers in Fragile Contexts <sup>22</sup>	Position paper about CORDAID's interventions towards engaging youth in S&J as agents of change for peace sustainability in Burundi, the CAR, Libya and Occupied Palestinian Territories. Limited information (unable to identify reports/evaluation).
11. Safe Age for Marriage in Yemen <sup>21</sup>	Fact sheet about endline survey of 400 households of a social norms intervention to catalyse change in social norms and communities' attitudes towards early marriage in Amran, Yemen. Limited information (unable to identify reports/evaluation)
12. Women as Peacebuilders in Yemen <sup>23</sup>	Qualitative study based on 94 in-depth interviews and 6 FGDs with men and women, women engaged in peacebuilding, traditional and religious leaders, village councils and local government in 3 governorates in Yemen.

## **Appendix 4: Additional Resources**

# Other social norms interventions approaches to corruption and S&J in non-FCAS contexts:

- Understanding Corruption in Criminal Justice as Robust and Resilient System in Uganda<sup>24</sup>. CDA Collaborative Learning Projects
- Corruption, Social Norms and Behaviours A comparative assessment of Rwanda, Tanzania and Uganda<sup>25</sup>. Basel Institute on Governance
- "Addressing bribery in the Tanzanian health sector: A behavioural approach". ACE Global Integrity.
- "Cities of Integrity: urban planning and corruption in Africa" (South Africa and Zambia). ACE Global Integrity.

#### Social norms approaches to corruption resources:

- "Anti-corruption through a social norms lens"2
- "Understanding Social Norms: A Reference Guide for Policy and Practice"
- "Reassessing donor performance in anti-corruption. Pathways to more effective practice"<sup>26</sup>

#### References

- The World Bank Group. List of Fragile and Conflict-affected Situations (FCAS). (2020). Available at: http://pubdocs.worldbank.org/en/888211594267968803/FCSList-FY21.pdf.
- 2. Jackson, D. & Köbis, N. C. Anti-corruption through a social norms lens. *U4 Issue* 1–58 (2018). Available at: https://www.u4.no/publications/anti-corruption-through-a-social-norms-lens.pdf.
- 3. Scharbatke-Church, C. & Chigas, D. Understanding Social Norms: A Reference Guide for Policy and Practice. 84 (2019). Available at: https://sites.tufts.edu/ihs/social-norms-reference-guide/.
- 4. Four avenues of normative influence: A research agreed for health promotion in low and mid-income countries. Health Psychol. 2018; 37(6), 562–573.
- 5. Cislaghi B, Mackie G, Nkwi P, Shakya H. Social norms and child marriage in Cameroon: An application of the theory of normative spectrum. Glob. Public Health. 2019; 14(10), 1479-1494.
- 6. Goff, A. Le, Bitong, L. & Morvan, H. Rapport Final. Revue Transitionnelle du Programme Kuleta Haki. *Transition International CDA Collaborative Learning Projects* (2017). Available at: https://sites.tufts.edu/ihs/files/2020/07/Rapport-Final-Revue-Transitionnelle-du-Programme-Kuleta-Haki.pdf.
- 7. Scharbatke-Church, C., Barnard-Webster, K., Sjogren, S. & Twagiramungu, N. "Justice Without Corruption, It's Possible I'm Committed". Final Evaluation Report. *CDA Collaborative Learning Projects, RCN Justice & Démocratie* (2017). Available at: https://www.cdacollaborative.org/publication/justice-without-corruption-possible-im-committed/.
- 8. Scharbatke-Church, C. et al. 'Pity the man who is alone': Corruption in the criminal justice system in Bangui, Central African Republic. CDA Collaborative Learning Projects (2017). Available at: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/320908664\_Pity\_the\_man\_who\_is\_alone.
- 9. Koni Hoffmann, L., Patel Candidate, R. & Arkwright, P. Collective Action on Corruption in Nigeria: A Social Norms Approach to Connecting Society and Institutions. *Chatham House* **44**, (2017).
- 10. MAGENTA. Behavioural Research Report: Anticorruption Project Implementation Plan. *TAPPI Journal* 80 (2019). doi:10.32964/tj18.3
- 11. MAGENTA. The Afghan Experience of Corruption: A citizen journey mapping research report. (2019). doi:10.1016/j.ajodo.2018.11.007
- 12. Onwujekwe, O. *et al.* Where do we start? Building consensus on drivers of health sector corruption in Nigeria and ways to address it. *Int. J. Heal. Policy Manag.* **9**, 286–296 (2020).
- 13. Onyia, F. O. Nepotism, Cronyism and Prebendalism: an Exploration of the Mores That Reinforce Corruption in Nigeria's Political System. *Glob. J. Polit. Sci. Adm.* **8**, 1–13 (2020).
- 14. Martini, M. Nigeria: Evidence of corruption and the influence of social norms. *U4 Anti-Corruption Resource Centre* 12 (2014). Available at: https://www.transparency.org/files/content/corruptionqas/Nigeria\_overview\_of\_c orruption\_and\_influence\_of\_social\_norms\_2014.pdf.
- 15. Luccaro, T. & Gaston, E. Women's Access to Justice in Afghanistan. *United States Institute of Peace* (2014).

- 16. Ibreck, R., Logan, H. & Pendle, N. Negotiating Justice: Courts as local civil authority during the conflict in South Sudan.
- 17. Corboz, J., Siddiq, W., Hemat, O., Chirwa, E. D. & Jewkes, R. What works to prevent violence against children in Afghanistan? Findings of an interrupted time series evaluation of a school-based peace education and community social norms change intervention in Afghanistan. *PLoS ONE* **14**, (2019).
- Denny, E. & Hughes, C. Attitudes, practices and social norms survey: Endline Report. (2017). Available at: https://itad.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/11/V4C-ASPN-Endline-Report-Print-Ready-ID-179962.pdf.
- 19. Glass, N. *et al.* Evaluating the communities care program: Best practice for rigorous research to evaluate gender based violence prevention and response programs in humanitarian settings. *Confl. Health* **12**, 1–10 (2018).
- 20. Perrin, N. *et al.* Social norms and beliefs about gender based violence scale: A measure for use with gender based violence prevention programs in low-resource and humanitarian settings. *Confl. Health* **13**, 1–12 (2019).
- 21. Freij, L. S. "Safe Age of Marriage" in Yemen: Fostering change in social norms. *Pathfinder International* 1–4 (2009). Available at: https://www.pathfinder.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/10/ESD-Child-Marriage.pdf.
- 22. CORDAID. Youth: Game Changers in Fragile Contexts. (2015). Available at: https://www.cordaid.org/en/wp-content/uploads/sites/3/2015/02/Position\_Paper\_Youth\_LR\_12032015.pdf.
- 23. Heinze, M.-C. & Stevens, S. Women As Peacebuilders in Yemen. 1–58 (2018). Available at: http://www.yemenpolling.org/advocacy/upfiles/YPCPublications\_Executive-Summary-and-Key-Findings-%93Women-as-Peacebulider-in-Yemen%94-June-2018.pdf.
- 24. Scharbarke-Church, C. & Barnard-Webster, K. Undersanding Corruption in Criminal Justice as a Robust and Resilient System. (2017).
- 25. Baez Camargo, C. Corruption, Social Norms and Behaviours: A comparative assessment of Rwanda, Tanzania and Uganda. *Basel Institute on Governance* 26 (2017). Available at: https://www.baselgovernance.org/publications/corruption-social-norms-and-behaviours-comparative-assessment-rwanda-tanzania-and.
- 26. Mason, P. Reassessing donor performance in anti-corruption. Pathways to more effective practice. *U4 Anti-Corruption Resource Centre* (2021). Available at: https://www.u4.no/publications/reassessing-donor-performance-in-anti-corruption.

